Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

MEETING

STATE OF CALIFORNIA

INTEGRATED WASTE MANAGEMENT BOARD

PERMITTING AND COMPLIANCE COMMITTEE

SOUTH COAST AIR QUALITY MANAGEMENT DISTRICT

21865 E. COPLEY DRIVE

AUDITORIUM

DIAMOND BAR, CALIFORNIA

THURSDAY, DECEMBER 11, 2008

10:09 A.M.

JAMES F. PETERS, CSR, RPR CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER LICENSE NUMBER 10063

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

ii

APPEARANCES

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

- Ms. Rosalie Mulé, Chairperson
- Ms. Margo Reid Brown

STAFF

- Mr. Mark Leary, Executive Director
- Mr. Elliot Block, Chief Counsel
- Mr. Raffy Kouyoumdjian
- Mr. Howard Levenson, Director, Local Jurisdiction, State Agency & Business Assistance Program
- Ms. Cara Morgan, Chief, Local Assistance & Market Development Division
- $\operatorname{Mr.}$ Ted Rauh, Director, Waste Compliance & Mitigation Program
- $\operatorname{Mr.}$ Frank Simpson, Supervisor, Jurisdiction Compliance & Audit Section

ALSO PRESENT

- Mr. Russell Betts, City of Desert Hot Springs
- Mr. Mike Bevins, City of California City
- Mr. David Brownlee, City of Needles
- Ms. Karen Coca, City of Los Angeles
- Mr. Tony Dahlerbruch, City of Rolling Hills
- Mr. Rick Daniels, City of Desert Hot Springs
- Ms. Nan Drake, E.J. Harrison & Son
- Ms. Nancy Driggers, City of Murrieta
- Mr. David Farrion, City of Calimesa

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

iii

APPEARANCES CONTINUED

ALSO PRESENT

- Mr. Ernie Garcia, City of Norwalk
- Mr. Maura Garcia, City of Vista
- Mr. Michael Harvey, City of Compton
- Mr. Robert Lemon, City of Moreno Valley
- Ms. Melissa Morgan, City of Highland
- Ms. Debbie Morris, City of Lawndale
- Ms. Kim Nilsson, City of Malibu
- Mr. John Oropeza, City of Bell Gardens
- Mr. Steve Preston, City of San Gabriel
- Ms. Julie Reyes, City of Moreno Valley
- ${\tt Mr. Rico \; Smith, \; City \; of \; Compton}$
- Mr. John Turner, City of Santa Paula
- Mr. Dylan Wright, Orange Unincorporated
- Mr. Peter Wulfman, San Bernardino unincorporated

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

iv INDEX PAGE Roll Call and Declaration Of Quorum 1 Public Comment 2 Program Directors` Report 1 В. Consideration Of The Biennial Review Findings For The Source Reduction And Recycling Element; And Consideration Of Issuance Of A Compliance Order For The City Of Compton, Los Angeles County 3 Motion 18 Vote 18 Consideration Of The 2005/2006 Biennial Review C. Findings For The Source Reduction And Recycling Element; And Consideration Of Issuance Of A Compliance Order For The City Of Santa Paula, Ventura County 19 Motion 24 24 Vote Consideration Of The 2005/2006 Biennial Review D. Findings For The Source Reduction And Recycling Element, Household Hazardous Waste Element, And Approval Of Biomass Diversion Claims/ Transformation Diversion Claims And/Or Construction And Demolition Waste Deduction Claims For The Following Jurisdictions (Good Faith Effort To Implement Programs): Kern County: California City; Los Angeles County: Bell Gardens, Lawndale, Malibu, Norwalk, Rolling Hills, San Gabriel; Orange County: Orange Unincorporated; Riverside County: Calimesa, Desert Hot Springs, Moreno Valley, Murrieta; San Bernardino County: Grand Terrace, Highland, Needles, Redlands, San Bernardino Unincorporated; San Diego County: Lemon Grove, Vista; 25 89 Motion Vote 89 90 Adjournment Reporter's Certificate 91

PROCEEDINGS 1 2 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Good morning, everyone. 3 Welcome to the December 11th meeting of the Permitting and 4 Compliance Committee for the California Integrated Waste 5 Management Board. 6 We have agendas outside on the table. And we 7 also have some speaker slips. So if you would like to address our Committee, please fill one out and bring it up to Diane, who is here to my left, and you will have an opportunity to address our Committee. 10 11 Also, I would like to ask everyone to please either turn off or put in the silent mode your cell phones and pagers. It would be much appreciated. 13 14 Thank you. 15 And with that, Diane, would you please call the 16 roll. COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Member Brown? 17 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Present. 18 19 COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Chair Mulé? CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Here. 20 21 Thank you. 22 Do we have any ex partes to report? 23 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: I'm up-to-date, Madam

CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: As am I.

24 Chair.

- 1 Thank you.
- 2 Let's move into our Director's report if we have
- 3 any today. Either Howard or Ted.
- 4 No Director's report?
- 5 WASTE COMPLIANCE & MITIGATION PROGRAM DIRECTOR
- 6 RAUH: No.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Okay. Very Good.
- 8 Then let's get into our agenda -- or actually
- 9 what I'd like to do is go to public comment. We do have
- 10 one speaker for public comment.
- 11 Would you please come forward and identify
- 12 yourself for the record.
- MS. COCA: Good morning, Madam Chair, members of
- 14 the Committee. My name's Karen Coca. I work for the city
- 15 of Los Angeles, but I'm also the Executive Director of the
- 16 Los Angeles Area Regional Agency.
- 17 And this is just an introductory item. I just
- 18 wanted to say that we had a LARA meeting here this morning
- 19 so we could come to the meeting. And 11 of our member
- 20 cities are here.
- 21 Can you guys stand up, say hi.
- Our chair, Anna Luke, is from Manhattan Beach.
- 23 And we have many other cities that are trying hard to
- 24 implement more recycling programs. And I'm happy to say
- 25 several received DOC grants so they could expand or begin

- 1 multi-family recycling programs, which has always been a
- 2 challenge.
- 3 And the city of Los Angeles is also expanding its
- 4 multi-family recycling program. We're up to about 370,000
- 5 units out of about 540,000 total. So we're doing the best
- 6 we can.
- 7 And I'm also proud to say that, as a group, we
- 8 achieved in 2006 a 62 percent diversion rate, but we don't
- 9 expect to stop there.
- 10 Anyway, I just wanted to introduce ourselves.
- 11 And thank you for coming to southern California.
- 12 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Well, thank you. And thank
- 13 you all for being here today. We appreciate your
- 14 presence.
- 15 Okay. With that, let's move on to our agenda.
- 16 First, we're going to hear Committee Item C.
- 17 WASTE COMPLIANCE & MITIGATION PROGRAM DIRECTOR
- 18 RAUH: Yes. Good morning, Chair Mulé and Member Brown.
- 19 I'm Ted Rauh, the Director of the Waste Compliance and
- 20 Mitigation Program.
- 21 Committee Item C and D, actually I'll kind of
- 22 introduce both of them, at this time, with an overview.
- Our Consideration of the 2005/6 Biennial Review
- 24 Findings for the Source Reduction and Recycling Elements;
- 25 and Consideration of Issuance of Compliance Orders for

- 1 both the Cities of Compton and Santa Paula, respectively.
- 2 The Waste Compliance and Mitigation Program's
- 3 Jurisdiction, Compliance and Audit Section reviews a
- 4 jurisdiction's compliance when Local Assistance and Market
- 5 Development staff refer the jurisdiction because it may
- 6 not be making a good-faith effort.
- 7 Jurisdiction staff conduct an -- this is our
- 8 Compliance staff -- conduct an independent in-depth
- 9 evaluation of all the aspects of the jurisdiction's
- 10 diversion program in accordance with the Board's
- 11 enforcement policy. And our review includes, and is not
- 12 limited to, the residential recycling programs, their
- 13 participation rates, commercial diversion programs, and
- 14 activities to achieve their goals, types of commercial
- 15 truck routes, wet and dry routes as well. That includes
- 16 our staff actually conducting audits of those routes. And
- 17 you see the results of those reviews in the pictorial
- 18 packages associated with each of the items.
- 19 We also looked at the material recovery
- 20 facilities that are being used by the jurisdictions, both
- 21 landfill recycling activities as well as recycling
- 22 activities.
- 23 All this analysis includes a review of the
- 24 disposal trends and their ability to achieve their goals.
- On occasion, our staff will find that a

- 1 jurisdiction is satisfactorily improving its performance
- 2 in the period of time between when it's been handed to us
- 3 for review. However, that's not the case with these two
- 4 jurisdictions. And so before you today are two items
- 5 requesting compliance orders for both cities.
- 6 Here to present those items in just a moment are
- 7 the staff who are associated with conducting the reviews.
- 8 But before we get to that point, I just wanted to
- 9 highlight what the next steps would be if, in fact, the
- 10 Board approved the orders.
- 11 First, the cities would develop Local
- 12 Implementation Plans that basically would see their
- 13 compliance with the compliance order. Our staff would
- 14 then monitor the progress in meeting those compliance
- 15 plans. And basically as the local governments carry out
- 16 those compliance plans, we would be there to review and
- 17 ensure that they are satisfactorily meeting those
- 18 objectives.
- 19 If they are successful, we'd be back to you
- 20 recommending that they be removed from the Compliance
- 21 Order. If they're not successful, we would be back to you
- 22 suggesting that the Board adopt a compliance penalty
- 23 associated with their lack of performance.
- 24 So those would be the succeeding steps assuming
- 25 your actions are to approve those orders today.

- 1 Here to present Item B is Raffy Kouyoumdjian,
- 2 which I think I just ruined his name.
- 3 (Laughter.)
- 4 WASTE COMPLIANCE & MITIGATION PROGRAM DIRECTOR
- 5 RAUH: But he'll correct it for the record.
- I apologize, Raffy. Take it away, please.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Good morning, Raffy.
- 8 MR. KOUYOUMDJIAN: Good morning, Madam Chair and
- 9 Board Member Brown. My name is Raffy Kouyoumdjian of the
- 10 Jurisdiction Compliance and Audit Section.
- 11 Board staff is bringing forward its biennial
- 12 review findings that the city of Compton in Los Angeles
- 13 County has failed to adequately implement its diversion
- 14 programs.
- This is how staff conducted its review. Staff
- 16 reviewed the city's program implementation and diversion
- 17 rates using available information from the city's annual
- 18 reports, waste hauler tonnage reports, solid waste
- 19 disposal activity reports and Board databases.
- 20 Staff also gathered information about the city's
- 21 past and current diversion efforts through on-site
- 22 observations, consultations, telephone calls,
- 23 correspondence and visits with city staff, the city's
- 24 franchise hauler, and the city's primary waste handling
- 25 facility.

- In addition, Board staff asked for and reviewed
- 2 all available 2007 data and reports, thereby establishing
- 3 trends of current program implementation.
- 4 The city was on a Compliance Order for failure to
- 5 implement diversion programs. On January 17th, 2007, the
- 6 Board considered completion of the Compliance Order for
- 7 the city's SRRE program implementation. Following the
- 8 Board's adoption of completion of the Compliance Order,
- 9 the city discontinued implementation of its programs.
- 10 Based on staff's complete analysis, staff has determined
- 11 that the city has failed to adequately implement its
- 12 diversion programs. In determining compliance with the
- 13 waste diversion mandates, the statute directs the Board to
- 14 consider both a jurisdiction's efforts to implement its
- 15 program selected in its Source Reduction and Recycling
- 16 Element and the jurisdiction's achievement of diversion
- 17 rate.
- 18 The city's residential and commercial diversion
- 19 programs are deficient. It is essential that the city's
- 20 residential and commercial programs be robust, because the
- 21 city's residential sector generates 30 percent of the
- 22 city's waste stream and the city's commercial sector
- 23 generates 70 percent of the city's waste stream. Pages
- 24 four, five and six of the agenda item provide details of
- 25 the deficiencies that the Board staff observed.

- 1 Additionally, Attachment 1, a photo report,
- 2 visually documents deficiencies in the city's residential
- 3 diversion efforts.
- 4 The city's diversion programs are not providing
- 5 sufficient reductions in disposal to enable the city to
- 6 achieve the diversion requirements of Public Resources
- 7 Code Section 41780. Diversion rates are an indicator of
- 8 diversion program effectiveness. The city's 2005 and 2006
- 9 diversion rates are 52 and 51 percent respectively.
- 10 Board staff recommends the issuance of a
- 11 Compliance Order that will require the city to work
- 12 directly with Board staff to develop a Local
- 13 Implementation Plan. This Local Implementation Plan will
- 14 identify a strategy for program enhancements and local
- 15 actions necessary to enable the city to achieve the
- 16 diversion requirements.
- 17 Representatives from the city are present to make
- 18 a presentation and answer any questions.
- 19 At this time, I would like to take the
- 20 opportunity to thank Steve Uselton, Primitivo Nunez, and
- 21 Joe Rasmussen of the southern California Office for Local
- 22 Assistance and Market Development for their assistance
- 23 with this item.
- 24 This concludes my presentation. Staff is
- 25 available to answer any questions you may have.

- 1 Thank you.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you, Raffy.
- 3 Do we have any questions for staff?
- 4 I do have a list of representatives from the city
- 5 here. Would anyone from the city or any of their
- 6 representatives like to address the Committee?
- 7 Please come forward and identify yourself for the
- 8 record.
- 9 Thank you.
- 10 MR. HARVEY: Good morning, Board Chair and Board.
- 11 My name is Michael Harvey. I'm the project manager for
- 12 the city of Compton.
- Before I go into my presentation, I'd like to
- 14 have the Assistant City Manager, Mr. Rico Smith, come up
- 15 and read a letter from our City Manager into the record,
- 16 please.
- 17 MR. SMITH: Good morning. I'm Rico Smith, one of
- 18 two assistant city managers for the city of Compton. And
- 19 I'm very pleased and humbled to be here this morning.
- 20 But what I'd like to do is read a response from
- 21 our city manager as it relates to this situation that we
- 22 find ourselves in.
- 23 And this letter is addressed to Frank Simpson,
- 24 Supervisor, Jurisdiction Compliance and Audit Section,
- 25 regarding the 30-day notice of intent to issue the city of

1	Compton's Compliance Order for failure to adequately		
2	implement its Source Reduction and Recycling Element and		
3	meet the 50 percent diversion requirement dated November		
4	6th, 2008.		
5	"In response to your letter		
6	notifying the city that the California		
7	Integrated Waste Management Board will		
8	be considering issuing a Compliance		
9	Order as a result of a review of our		
10	progress in implementing diversion		
11	programs to meet the requirements of		
12	Public Resources Code PRC Section 41780,		
13	we will point out that the city" hold		
14	on one second "that the city of		
15	Compton has endured an unfortunate set		
16	of circumstances, which has led us to an		
17	embarrassing failure to comply with the		
18	regulations and a humbling realization		
19	that we must again cover ground we have		
20	already overcome previously.		
21	"While we have taken steps to		
22	immediately reverse recent trends, we		
23	have failed to perform above the 51		
24	percent diversion rate required for		
25	compliance. Nevertheless, our city		

1		remains steadfast in our commitment to
2		regain our compliance status, and we are
3		here to work with staff to develop,
4		implement and achieve a plan to regain
5		and maintain our compliance status.
6		"We ask that you accept our most
7		sincere apology for the lapse in
8		performance, and that we will work with
9		staff to develop an acceptable
10		methodology for a timely and effective
11		and achievable plan, which will put into
12		place measures that will assist us in
13		meeting and maintaining state-mandated
14		recycling goals.
15		"Finally, this is not just the
16		city's response. It is our humble
17		commitment and mission to achieve full
18		compliance. And thank you in advance
19		for any consideration."
20		And I'd like to enter this memo from our city
21	manager	into the record.
22		CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you. Appreciate that.
23		Any questions for the city?
24		Okay. I just Oh, I'm sorry. Go ahead.
25		No, go ahead, continue.

- 1 MR. SMITH: No, I was clearing my throat.
- 2 MR. HARVEY: Thank you, Board, again. My name
- 3 again is Michael Harvey. I am the project manager
- 4 responsible for our compliance in dealing with all of our
- 5 contracts, including our trash, our used oil and our
- 6 recycling.
- 7 Again, our city manager -- assistant city manager
- 8 has given you the information. We know where we are and
- 9 we know that we've had a poor opportunity, because of some
- 10 things that have happened to us, which have caused us to
- 11 go where we are. We've had some huge opportunities. We
- 12 had a hauler leave us with two-weeks notice. And our main
- 13 responsibility for us was the public safety of our
- 14 citizens and making sure that we had trash picked up.
- We know that we have an opportunity and we're
- 16 here to meet that opportunity.
- 17 I've given the clerk a package for each of you
- 18 just to show you where we are going and how we feel. I've
- 19 given you a packet in line with our new education program
- 20 that we have started. And there's a first flier that went
- 21 out. That flier has gone out and is on its way out to
- 22 every one of our residents to inform them of how we can
- 23 better improve and that we're all a team to get this done.
- 24 Along with that, our city council has made huge
- 25 strides in the last month that we have never done before.

- 1 They have issued two brand new ordinances. One that's a
- 2 construction and demolition ordinance talking about the
- 3 way that we believe we need to move forward. We've never
- 4 had that before. We've done it, but we haven't had it in
- 5 law. It's in law now.
- 6 We've done a new recycling ordinance in regards
- 7 to getting everyone who's within the city of Compton who's
- 8 recycling to report, so we know exactly what our waste
- 9 diversion is and where it is going.
- 10 Other than that, we've also done some major
- 11 things that are real important to us. We are proud to be
- 12 one of the first cities to do a multi-family diversion
- 13 rate for beverage recycling. We have received -- our
- 14 haulers received, excuse me -- \$285,000 to do multi-family
- 15 beverage recycling. We're going be one of the first south
- 16 bay cities to increase and do a major program that's going
- 17 to include pick up, it's going to include education, and
- 18 it's going to include one-on-one operations with
- 19 multi-families, where we're going to do further than just
- 20 the trash can. We're get to hit the home and we're
- 21 actually going to help them to divert their cans, to
- 22 divert their paper, multi-conglomerates. So we're
- 23 actually ahead of the game in what we feel like.
- We have reinstituted our programs with our
- 25 three-container system, which there are pictures in the

- 1 back. We also have gone to our new sticker program, which
- 2 I issued each of you copies, so you can see that we've
- 3 placed on all of our containers. We have over 22,000
- 4 customers that we deal with on a day-to-day basis. And
- 5 this is a huge opportunity for us. With over a hundred
- 6 thousand residents, we are looking forward to the
- 7 challenge.
- 8 We've instituted a new commercial recycling
- 9 program, a new industrial recycling program. We've
- 10 actually completed all of our audits and have found new
- 11 and great ways. Besides just diverting, we have found
- 12 ways. And I'd like to share one that's very important to
- 13 me. And, that is, we have Owens Corning in our city, and
- 14 that's where they produce all the roofing. They had over
- 15 11 40-cubic-yard bins that were going to the trash bin and
- 16 being sent right to waste. We were able -- our hauler was
- 17 able to work with them, and that 11 is down to 3, because
- 18 we were able to work with them to find a company that
- 19 would be able to take their seconds, so that they were not
- 20 going to end up in the waste stream.
- 21 We also have Ralph's. Their distribution center
- 22 comes out of Compton. We are now keeping track of all of
- 23 their cardboard, which is a huge opportunity, because
- 24 cardboard is worth about nothing right now. So --
- 25 (Laughter.)

- 1 MR. HARVEY: -- to sit there and actually work
- 2 with them to divert their cardboard, to work with them
- 3 right now in their food waste, because they have a niche
- 4 recycling for dog food, we're proud of those opportunities
- 5 that we're having stepping forward.
- 6 We actually have done new and improved things in
- 7 our education, and we are working right now with the
- 8 community college, the school district to create a new
- 9 education, along with the fact that we have started a new
- 10 education that is going to actually kick off a brand new
- 11 website for our residents, so that can get right there and
- 12 see exactly what's going on.
- 13 We know we have opportunities and we know that we
- 14 have missed the ball. But we are proud to stand in front
- 15 of you and say that we are looking forward to meeting the
- 16 challenges with staff. To give you an idea from the
- 17 report you see how low we were, I'm proud to tell you in
- 18 November that we were 30.3 percent in our diversion rate.
- 19 So we are coming up. We are committed to coming up. Our
- 20 city management, our city council has taken the steps to
- 21 make sure that we never fall in this area ever again.
- 22 So with that, I would ask that you would allow us
- 23 the opportunity to work with staff to implement a local
- 24 assistance program -- or local implementation program that
- 25 will help us to move forward. Because in all that we do,

- 1 there's everything across the state that other
- 2 jurisdictions are doing that we can benefit from that we
- 3 may not know. We look forward to working with staff and
- 4 we would look forward to the opportunity to be compliant
- 5 again and staying compliant.
- 6 Thank you very much.
- 7 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you very much, Mr.
- 8 Harvey.
- 9 Any questions for Mr Harvey?
- 10 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: I was ready to applaud
- 11 too.
- 12 (Laughter.)
- 13 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Mr. Harvey, thank you
- 14 very much. I think it sounds like you are turning things
- 15 around. I think in preparation for this meeting today, it
- 16 was a little troublesome that once you did finally become
- 17 relieved from your previous Compliance Order, that there
- 18 was a hauler change. And for whatever reason and whatever
- 19 circumstances, I think that that's -- it sounds like you
- 20 are moving in the right direction, with the city council
- 21 passing the ordinances. That's extremely important,
- 22 especially the C&D ordinance.
- 23 And you spoke specifically about opportunities.
- 24 And I think you're right. We have a staff that is
- 25 extremely knowledgeable. I think it is an opportunity for

- 1 Compton to show their true commitment.
- But I think something that's really important is
- 3 to maintain and establish that long-term relationship with
- 4 your hauler, both for the city and for the residents. I
- 5 think that that continuity is going to be important as you
- 6 go forward. Rather than, you know, changing things at the
- 7 end, once you finally reached success, you know, stick
- 8 with it. And it sounds like you guys are doing the right
- 9 thing and want to -- I know the staff will step up and
- 10 provide you with the assistance you need to maintain that
- 11 new level of commitment.
- 12 So it's an opportunity to show your true
- 13 commitment to the goals.
- 14 So thank you.
- 15 MR. HARVEY: Thank you, Member Brown. We look
- 16 forward to having that opportunity. And our city council
- 17 is devoted to making sure we move forward in a positive
- 18 way. And we are looking at our opportunity with our
- 19 hauler. We've had some huge, huge challenges as it
- 20 relates to that. And we are just now at the point that we
- 21 will have a selective hauler that the council will walk
- 22 through the process and make sure that we have the best
- 23 hauler for the city of Compton.
- 24 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you, Michael.
- 25 And I too was a little concerned prior to this

- 1 meeting today. But I think after hearing your
- 2 presentation, it does sound like the city is back on
- 3 track.
- 4 We were so pleased to end the Compliance Order
- 5 back in '07, thinking that we had everything taken care
- 6 of. And so I know I personally was somewhat disappointed
- 7 to see that you had fallen off track. And it's just good
- 8 to see that the city's back on track and committed to
- 9 making -- to complying with the law, first and foremost,
- 10 but also protecting the public health and safety of your
- 11 residents and businesses in your community.
- 12 So thank you very much for being here today. And
- 13 we'll keep an eye on you to make sure you're following up
- 14 to do what you say you're going to be doing.
- 15 So thank you very much.
- 16 With that, if there's no other comments, do I
- 17 have a motion?
- 18 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: I move Resolution
- 19 2008-183.
- 20 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: And I second that.
- 21 That was moved by Board Member Brown, seconded by
- 22 myself.
- Diane, would you please call the roll.
- 24 COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Brown?
- 25 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Aye.

- 1 COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Mulé?
- 2 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Aye.
- 3 Thank you very much. That passes. And we will
- 4 put that on our consent agenda for the full Board on
- 5 Tuesday, December 16th.
- 6 So, again, thank you all for being here. And we
- 7 appreciate your work in getting back on track.
- 8 Thank you.
- 9 Okay. Our next item, Ted.
- 10 WASTE COMPLIANCE & MITIGATION PROGRAM DIRECTOR
- 11 RAUH: Yes, thank you, Chair Mulé.
- 12 The next item is Consideration of the 2005/6
- 13 Biennial Review Findings for the Source Reduction and
- 14 Recycling Element; and Consideration of Issuance of a
- 15 Compliance Order for the City of Santa Paul in Ventura
- 16 County.
- 17 And here to present the item is Frank Simpson.
- 18 JURISDICTION COMPLIANCE & AUDIT SECTION
- 19 SUPERVISOR SIMPSON: Madam Chair, Committee members. My
- 20 name is Frank Simpson with the Jurisdiction Compliance and
- 21 Audit Section.
- 22 Board staff is bringing forward its 2005-2006
- 23 biennial review findings that the city of Santa Paula in
- 24 Ventura County has failed to adequately implement its
- 25 diversion programs.

- 1 Staff reviewed the city's '05-'06 program
- 2 implementation and diversion rates using available
- 3 information from the city's annual reports, waste hauler
- 4 tonnage reports, solid waste disposal activity reports,
- 5 and Board databases.
- 6 Staff also gathered information about the city's
- 7 past and current diversion efforts through on-site
- 8 observations, consultations, telephone calls,
- 9 correspondence and visits with the city staff, the city's
- 10 franchise hauler, and the city's primary waste handling
- 11 facility.
- 12 In addition, Board staff asked for and reviewed
- 13 all available 2007 data and reports, thereby establishing
- 14 trends of current program implementation. Based on
- 15 staff's complete analysis, staff has determined that the
- 16 city has failed to adequately implement its diversion
- 17 programs.
- 18 In determining compliance with the waste
- 19 diversion mandates, the statute directs the Board to
- 20 consider both a jurisdiction's efforts to implement its
- 21 programs selected in its Source Reduction and Recycling
- 22 Element and the jurisdiction's achievement of the
- 23 diversion rate.
- 24 The city's commercial diversion program is
- 25 deficient. It is essential that the city's commercial

- 1 program be strong.
- 2 The city's residential sector generates 26
- 3 percent of the city's waste stream and the city's
- 4 commercial sector generates 74 percent of the waste
- 5 stream.
- 6 Pages four and five of the agenda item provide
- 7 details of the deficiencies that Board staff observed.
- 8 Additionally, Attachment 1, which is a photo report,
- 9 visually documents deficiencies in the city's commercial
- 10 diversion efforts.
- 11 The city's commercial diversion programs are not
- 12 providing sufficient reductions in disposal to enable the
- 13 city to achieve the diversion requirements of Public
- 14 Resources Code Section 41780.
- 15 Diversion rates are an indicator of diversion
- 16 program effectiveness. The city's '05 and '06 diversion
- 17 rates are 58 and 38 percent, respectively.
- 18 Board staff conducted another site visit to Santa
- 19 Paula yesterday and did observe several additional
- 20 recycling containers that were clean, newly painted,
- 21 dedicated, and clearly labeled. However, staff did find a
- 22 high contamination rate and is still unable to evaluate
- 23 the effectiveness of those programs.
- 24 Board staff recommends the issuance of a
- 25 Compliance Order that will require the city to work

- 1 directly with Board staff to develop a Local
- 2 Implementation Plan. This plan will identify a strategy
- 3 for program enhancements and local actions necessary to
- 4 enable the city to achieve diversion requirements.
- 5 Representatives from the city are present to
- 6 answer any questions today.
- 7 This concludes my presentation. And staff is
- 8 available to answer any questions you may have.
- 9 Thank you.
- 10 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you, Frank.
- We do have one speaker. Nan Drake.
- 12 Would you come forward.
- MS. DRAKE: Good morning, Chairman Mulé, Member
- 14 Brown. I'm here representing the Santa Clara Valley
- 15 Disposal and E.J. Harrison & Sons.
- 16 Basically, I wanted to make myself available to
- 17 answer questions about our programs. We basically are one
- 18 of the haulers that deal in the commercial waste stream.
- 19 One of the major corrections that we made after
- 20 the visitations by your staff to the facility that Gold
- 21 Coast Recycling, one of the Harrison companies, did, and
- 22 that's -- we have multi-family recycling in Santa Paula,
- 23 something that Los Angeles hasn't really moved forward yet
- 24 with. And one of the problems is we tried a program
- 25 called unicycling, which, as you know, other cities that

- 1 the Harrisons serve are at 70 percent, 66 percent. It's
- 2 worked perfect. We tried to use it in the multi-family.
- 3 It did not work. There was contamination of green waste
- 4 and there was food waste. That has totally been
- 5 corrected. There are no longer any unicycling bins in the
- 6 multi-family units. They have all been converted to white
- 7 bins and to regular trash service.
- 8 We have also -- as you've noted, I mailed you the
- 9 information -- we have begun a very, very strong
- 10 educational program. Actually, we've been working on that
- 11 since last June. It's both in Spanish and English. And
- 12 so we believe that what we can offer is basically the best
- 13 effort that we have in the commercial sector. It's a
- 14 small city. We don't have a Corning. We don't have any
- 15 large manufacturers. So it's mom and pop and it's
- 16 education and it's talking to them, and trying to move
- 17 forward in a good, strong recycling program.
- 18 I'm here to answer any questions.
- 19 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you.
- 20 And we also have Mr. John Turner. Did you just
- 21 want to come up and say a few words.
- 22 MR. TURNER: Good morning, Madam Chair, members
- 23 of the Committee. Yes, my name is John Turner. I'm the
- 24 interim Public Works Director for the city of Santa Paula.
- 25 And I wanted to just say that I appreciate the opportunity

1 for us to work with the staff to obtain and achieve the

- 2 goals of the LIP.
- 3 So if you have any questions of me, I'll be more
- 4 than happy to answer them. I've included in your packets
- 5 ahead of time sort of an overview of our program.
- 6 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for being here.
- 7 Do we have any questions of the city or --
- 8 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: No. But I'm happy to
- 9 see that the unicycling's gone. From the photos we saw,
- 10 it wasn't working, was it, Nan, at all?
- MS. DRAKE: No.
- 12 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Very unsuccessful. So
- 13 appreciate your commitment to working with Board staff to
- 14 see how we can improve your program implementation,
- 15 especially in the commercial area. I think that's where
- 16 we observed was the most troublesome.
- 17 So thank you for being here.
- 18 MS. TURNER: Thank you.
- 19 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Thank you, Nan, also.
- 20 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Again, thank you for being
- 21 here. Yeah, I too -- I know that there are no -- or very
- 22 few large businesses in the city. And I know the
- 23 challenges you face with recycling with the smaller
- 24 mom-and-pop type businesses. However, I think that -- I
- 25 strongly encourage you to continue to work with our staff

- 1 to work on that portion of the Local Implementation Plan.
- 2 So with that, if there are no further questions,
- 3 do I have a motion?
- 4 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: I move Resolution
- 5 2008-195.
- 6 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Second.
- 7 That was moved by Chair Brown and seconded by
- 8 myself.
- 9 Would you please call the roll, Diane.
- 10 COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Member Brown?
- 11 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Aye.
- 12 COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Chair Mulé?
- 13 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Aye.
- 14 And so that item will be moved onto the consent
- 15 agenda for the full Board meeting on Tuesday, December
- 16 16th.
- 17 Again, I want to thank you all for being here.
- 18 Let's continue. Now, we will go to our
- 19 "good-faith effort" items, which is Board Agenda Item 6.
- So we're going to give everybody a minute to
- 21 switch seats here and move into that portion of our agenda
- 22 here today.
- Okay. Let's proceed.
- Howard, good morning.
- 25 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS

- 1 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Good morning, Madam
- 2 Chair, Member Brown. I'm Howard Levenson. I'm Director
- 3 of the Board's Sustainability Program.
- 4 And in introducing this item, I'd like to provide
- 5 you and our staff and our jurisdictions with a bit of an
- 6 overview of all that went into the preparation of this
- 7 item.
- 8 Both Monday and today, you're hearing items
- 9 related to how jurisdictions are doing in relation to AB
- 10 939, which we all know mandated that California
- 11 jurisdictions implement programs to divert 50 percent of
- 12 their waste from landfills. So what the Board does on
- 13 these items, which you've done already this morning and
- 14 which you'll be considering in this item, speaks directly
- 15 to the core of this AB 939 diversion requirement.
- 16 Since we haven't done this kind of review in two
- 17 years, what I'd like to do is give you a little bit of
- 18 context and just be a reminder to all of us how the system
- 19 works and how we got to today's agenda item.
- Just to establish a reference point, AB 939
- 21 required each jurisdiction to submit initial plans to the
- 22 Board detailing how it would achieve this goal. Then, as
- 23 the folks in the audience know, each jurisdiction has to
- 24 submit an annual report describing program accomplishments
- 25 over the previous year. Every two years, the Board

- 1 formally evaluates progress of each jurisdiction towards
- 2 meeting the 50 percent goal and adequately implementing
- 3 the programs that it chose and planned. And because of
- 4 the time that's needed for us to garner the annual
- 5 reports, get appropriate data to calculate diversion rates
- 6 and then review programs and develop items, we typically
- 7 conduct this review about two years after the fact. So
- 8 here we are in December '08. We're looking at '05 and
- 9 '06.
- Just as a side bar, that's really one of the
- 11 major reasons why the Board successfully sponsored Senate
- 12 Bill 1016 this year, which will change the measurement
- 13 system in the future. And so you'll see a different kind
- 14 of review the next time around. Compliance requirements
- 15 will be the same, but we'll be looking at it from more of
- 16 a program implementation perspective than even we've done
- 17 to date.
- 18 But basically under the current system, the Board
- 19 has three options it can take for each jurisdiction:
- 20 First, it can find that they're in compliance.
- 21 So those jurisdictions that have met the requirements to
- 22 implement programs and achieve their diversion
- 23 requirement, then they're in full compliance.
- Then we have a second category, which we call
- 25 good-faith effort, which is really the subject of today's

- 1 agenda item. Those are jurisdictions that have a
- 2 numerical rate below 50 percent, but they've demonstrated
- 3 a good-faith effort to implement the programs to achieve
- 4 their diversion goal. And I think this reflects the
- 5 performance-based approach that the Board has taken to
- 6 jurisdiction review and performance over the years.
- 7 And then, third, obviously is to find a
- 8 jurisdiction out of the compliance. And you've acted on
- 9 three jurisdictions, two today and one on last Monday.
- 10 Now, I think it's important to understand that we
- 11 go through a very extensive review, a very extensive
- 12 process to evaluate jurisdictions and make a
- 13 recommendation. And this is true for all jurisdictions,
- 14 with even more review for those that are below the border
- 15 line of 50 percent. That review, that process is based on
- 16 statutory criteria, the enforcement policy that the Board
- 17 adopted in 2001, and various Board directives and policy
- 18 initiatives, such as the emphasis that we placed on
- 19 construction and demolition diversion programs, as we just
- 20 heard in the last item -- last couple of items, and on
- 21 procurement efforts. And this process has a very high
- 22 level of scrutiny by all levels of program management
- 23 within the Board.
- Now, for jurisdictions that have a numerical rate
- 25 over 50 percent, we assess the annual report and we use

- 1 information from previous site visits and from ongoing
- 2 discussions with the jurisdiction. And unless something
- 3 is amiss, we make a recommendation that those
- 4 jurisdictions be considered as compliant.
- 5 Those under the governance policies that were
- 6 adopted by the Board last year are delegated to the
- 7 Executive Director to make that final determination.
- 8 There's many examples. We have a total of 340
- 9 jurisdictions that are deemed compliant and are delegated
- 10 to the Executive Director. And that's really testimony to
- 11 the success of AB 939 and of the efforts that
- 12 jurisdictions in the private sector have made over the
- 13 years in terms of investments in programs and facilities.
- Now, if a jurisdiction has a rate that's under 50
- 15 percent, we conduct even more thorough comprehensive
- 16 evaluations that include new site visits and analyses. In
- 17 this review cycle, there were 61 jurisdictions that fell
- 18 into that category. We also have another 12 that are
- 19 already on existing Compliance Orders, and so they aren't
- 20 part of the review cycle, but that will continue through
- 21 our waste compliance and mitigation program to be
- 22 monitored and audited.
- 23 All of the jurisdictions, the 61, have been asked
- 24 to be here. I think most of them have had representatives
- 25 here certainly on Monday and probably today.

- 1 So what we do as staff is we conduct a site visit
- 2 to evaluate a jurisdiction's waste stream and the
- 3 diversion programs and to determine if there are program
- 4 gaps that exist and that need to be addressed, and we call
- 5 that a needs assessment. We have a lot of background
- 6 materials that staff uses. They're available on our
- 7 website to the public.
- 8 These include our Planning Annual Report
- 9 Information System, the PARIS system, with all the data
- 10 from the annual reports. And there's a whole list of
- 11 questions that are associated with those reports. We have
- 12 a needs assessment template. We have a biennial review
- 13 report template. That staff then takes all this
- 14 information and builds it into a relatively long document
- 15 that then goes into the internal program review process.
- 16 You have a summarized version of that document in
- 17 Attachment 6, a two pager for each jurisdiction. But that
- 18 reflects a lot more information that we have on hand
- 19 within the Board.
- 20 So staff meets with the jurisdiction
- 21 representatives and the haulers and businesses to discuss
- 22 how programs work and how they can be improved. And that
- 23 includes looking at the waste stream and doing dumpster
- 24 dives; going around to residential bins and seeing what
- 25 the contamination levels are; looking at outreach efforts,

- 1 the C&D program; going over hauler reports, things like
- 2 that. Based on this assessment and whether the
- 3 jurisdiction is making all reasonable and feasible
- 4 efforts, we then formulate a -- or staff formulates an
- 5 initial recommendation for either a good-faith effort or
- 6 for the need for a Compliance Order.
- 7 Now, to ensure consistency among the reviews and
- 8 because the Local Assistance and Market Development
- 9 Division has so many new staff and so many new assignments
- 10 that resulted from our reorganization last year, we
- 11 created a special management team to review staff's
- 12 analysis. And we fondly call it, or at least I call it,
- 13 the GFE Tribunal. Maybe we're the grand inquisitors
- 14 internally. But it consists of myself; Cara Morgan, to my
- 15 right, who's the Division Chief of the Local Assistance
- 16 and Market Development Division; Tamar Dyson from our
- 17 Legal Office; and then the crew, further to my right, Kyle
- 18 Pogue, Jennifer Caldwell, Steve Sorelle, and Steve
- 19 Uselton. These are branch managers and supervisors and
- 20 technical seniors who constitute this review panel.
- 21 So we looked at each of the draft reports that
- 22 staff compiled, the biennial review tools, and then we met
- 23 with the staff and managers over a period of four months
- 24 to go back and forth over these documents. In some cases,
- 25 we asked staff to do more follow up, go out for another

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

- 1 site visit or at least contact the jurisdiction and get
- 2 more information. Sometimes they had to come back and
- 3 meet with us again, sometimes resolve the issues by Email.
- 4 But I think the point is that there's a very extensive
- 5 review process that leads up to this item. The time and
- 6 energy that went into this on the parts of both staff and
- 7 the jurisdictions involved was quite substantial. And I
- 8 think we just want to recognize not just the folks here,
- 9 but you'll see we'll recognize the individual staff and
- 10 the jurisdictions who participated in this. And I think
- 11 they've done a great job on both sides of the -- both
- 12 parties.
- Of the 61 jurisdictions that were at -- were
- 14 below 50 percent and got this additional level of
- 15 scrutiny, we are recommending 55 for good-faith-effort
- 16 determinations. And that's the subject of Agenda Item 6.
- Now, you know already obviously that we
- 18 recommended a few for potential Compliance Orders, and
- 19 you've already heard those items. But I do want to point
- 20 out that in keeping with our reorganization philosophy of
- 21 having an independent enforcement unit, those cases were
- 22 transferred from the Local Assistance and Market
- 23 Development Division staff to the Jurisdiction Compliance
- 24 and Audit Section staff that you heard from already this
- 25 morning.

1 There were -- in that transferal of cases, the

- 2 Jurisdiction Compliance and Audit Section does go ahead
- 3 and, as you saw, they assess the jurisdictions and they
- 4 come back with their own recommendation. And in a couple
- 5 of cases, they did feel that the jurisdictions had
- 6 conducted -- or at least during the conferring period, had
- 7 implemented programs fully, and they actually shifted two
- 8 jurisdictions back to us for a good-faith-effort
- 9 recommendation. Those were heard on Monday. They were
- 10 Kerman in Fresno County and Madera in Madera County.
- 11 The Jurisdiction Compliance and Audit Section
- 12 will still continue to monitor those two since they were
- 13 sort of on the bubble. They will do random audits of
- 14 those jurisdictions in 2009.
- 15 So before we get into the individual items, I
- 16 just want to make two final points. One is that I think
- 17 this entire process serves a much broader purpose than
- 18 just the specific determination that you're making today.
- 19 Particularly with the reorganization and our new staff,
- 20 and then the passage of SB 1016, our orientation is
- 21 shifting more and more to being out in the field and
- 22 focusing more on program implementation.
- 23 It's certainly been the Board policy over the
- 24 years to focus on program implementation. That's now
- 25 codified in SB 1016 and we'll carry that forth in the

- 1 future.
- But this review process, under this particular
- 3 biennial review, has allowed a lot of staff to be present
- 4 in the field. And I hope to establish much stronger
- 5 relationships with the jurisdictions that they interact
- 6 with. So I think it does set the stage for a lot more
- 7 assistance in the future.
- 8 So I want to end by thanking all the folks up
- 9 here Leticia Gallegos, who's helped put the item
- 10 together, and then all the individual staff who we'll name
- 11 individually as we come to each jurisdiction.
- 12 And the way we're going to do this: Monday
- 13 obviously we heard most of the jurisdictions in the north.
- 14 Today, we've got the south jurisdictions. There's a lot
- 15 of attachments in this item. The primary attachment that
- 16 we are speaking about today is Attachment 6, where there's
- 17 a summary of the jurisdiction's performance. The
- 18 preceding documents provide you with estimated diversion
- 19 rates. And then where there are special cases related to
- 20 biomass diversion and construction and demolition debris
- 21 and other special circumstances, that's a documentation of
- 22 those kinds of claims.
- We're going to go through this -- the order of
- 24 the jurisdictions that we'll present is county by county,
- 25 as is listed in the title. If you want to find the

- 1 particular jurisdiction in Attachment 6, those are listed
- 2 alphabetically by jurisdiction. But we're going to go
- 3 county by county. For one thing that will give some sense
- 4 of what's happening in a particular region, so you start
- 5 seeing some of the synergies that may be happening between
- 6 some jurisdictions.
- 7 And I think that is all I wanted to say in the
- 8 way of introductory remarks.
- 9 Thank you, Madam. I'd be happy to answer any
- 10 questions before we go into the individual jurisdictions.
- 11 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you, Howard.
- I just want to make a brief comment before we
- 13 continue.
- 14 This, for me, is my third go-round in biennial
- 15 reviews. And I just want to thank our staff for all of
- 16 the work that you put into this. This new process, if you
- 17 will, is far improved from where we were. I can
- 18 appreciate all the work that went into this, and I want to
- 19 thank the Tribunal as well as all of our staff. And I
- 20 want to thank all of the jurisdictions for your
- 21 participation in this. It really helps to talk these
- 22 things through and really understand what's going on in
- 23 your communities and to help us determine whether or not
- 24 you deserve the good-faith effort. So I just want to
- 25 thank everybody for that.

- 1 So with that, let's start, Howard. Thank you.
- 2 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 3 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Okay. And rather
- 4 than have individual staff come up and make presentations,
- 5 what we're going to do is Cara and I will trade off
- 6 providing you with a summary. Cara will take several
- 7 jurisdictions, then I will. But we encourage the
- 8 jurisdictions to come up and make comments to the extent
- 9 that you desire. Certainly, most of them have
- 10 representatives here, and staff are here to answer any
- 11 specific questions that you have.
- 12 So I'm going to turn it over now to Cara.
- 13 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 14 CHIEF MORGAN: Thanks Howard.
- 15 Cara Morgan, Local Assistance and Market
- 16 Development Division.
- 17 The first jurisdiction we're going to talk about
- 18 is the city of California City. And I'd like to first
- 19 acknowledge the LAM team that worked with this city, Jill
- 20 Larner and Melissa Vargas.
- 21 Can you raise your hand.
- Thank you.
- 23 The city has implemented SB 1066 time extension
- 24 programs, all of them, with the exception of two. The
- 25 city implemented a printed education outreach campaign and

- 1 adopted a formal procurement policy. One of the programs
- 2 that was not implemented involves food waste diversion,
- 3 which is controlled primarily by a federal prison.
- 4 The city's diversion rate has historically been
- 5 above 50 percent until the federal prison was built in the
- 6 city in 2001. The city and our Board staff continues to
- 7 work with the prison in finding options for diverting the
- 8 prison's wet food waste. And the city is very committed
- 9 to continuing to investigate options.
- 10 So we have a lot of things in the works. I'm
- 11 really pleased with the efforts that Jill has -- really
- 12 been doing a lot of research in Kern County to see what
- 13 options there are for food waste.
- 14 While the city is implementing many diversion
- 15 programs, it does continue to face many challenges,
- 16 including the city's geographic location in the Mojave
- 17 Desert. I don't know how many of you have been to
- 18 California City, but it's way out in the middle of
- 19 nowhere. So they really are challenged with, you know,
- 20 limited access to markets. They've had a decline in jobs,
- 21 a rise, as you know, in fuel prices. And it really has
- 22 limited some of their ability to market recyclables.
- 23 However, they still continue to move forward.
- I do want to point out that in Attachment 6 on
- 25 page seven and eight we did reference that we had expected

- 1 the city to pass their C&D ordinance on November 18th, as
- 2 they were planning to do. However, that didn't happen.
- 3 The council asked the city staff to bring it back on
- 4 December 16th so that the new council members could hear
- 5 it. The first reading is scheduled for December 16th and
- 6 the second reading will be January 6th. And they expect
- 7 it to be adopted on January 20th. The city
- 8 representative, Mike Bevins, I believe is here; and we
- 9 would like him to come up and say a few words, please.
- 10 MR. BEVINS: Madam Chairman and Committee. My
- 11 name is Mike Bevins. I'm the Public Works Director for
- 12 the city of California City.
- 13 Most of that distance between civilization and
- 14 our city is our city.
- 15 (Laughter.)
- MR. BEVINS: We are the third largest city in the
- 17 State of California. We have over 200 square miles in our
- 18 city. So we are stretched on a great many issues.
- 19 In the last biennial round, our city went through
- 20 a significant growth spurt. Typically, our city has grown
- 21 at the rate of about 25 to 30 homes a year. That rate
- 22 went up to almost 400 per year in the years 2006, 2005 and
- 23 2007. To say it stretched our city services is an
- 24 understatement.
- 25 Also, in that timeframe, our prison, which has

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

1 gone in, now houses 2,600 federal inmates. And their just

- 2 natural recycle rate really skews our annual recycling
- 3 rate just by the nature of the fact that they don't have
- 4 the number of consumer goods and the number of consumables
- 5 that normally would happen in a normal city.
- 6 The federal prison has just approached us in the
- 7 last two weeks with a request to double the size of their
- 8 inmates, which again will have a heinous effect on our
- 9 ability to do this.
- 10 However, we are significantly committed to the
- 11 programs and to the projects. Our C&D ordinance came up,
- 12 and was scheduled to come up after the elections so that
- 13 it wouldn't be part of a political football, which we were
- 14 grateful that the elected officials and also grateful that
- 15 your staff recognized it.
- When it came up on the 18th, there was a typo.
- 17 And the typo simply said that we would be dealing with
- 18 structures over 5,000 square feet as opposed to over 500
- 19 square feet. As you can well imagine, that changed the
- 20 very nature of the ordinance itself and so it was delayed.
- 21 The incoming mayor has expressed to me his belief that the
- 22 ordinance should not be at 500 square feet. It should be
- 23 at 120 square feet. So I'm believing and I'm very
- 24 optimistic that the new council will deal with this matter
- 25 quickly.

- 1 Their first council meeting, they'll be sworn in
- 2 on the 16th. Typically, those sorts of council meetings
- 3 are one of victory and euphoria, and an item as mundane in
- 4 their perspective as a commercial trash -- a commercial
- 5 recycling is not one that's likely to be dealt with. It's
- 6 my belief they'll probably postpone it, deal with it the
- 7 2nd of January, and then have the second meeting on the
- 8 20th of January for an implementation 30 days later.
- 9 I've had nothing but support from my council on
- 10 that. So my expectation is that it will be passed.
- 11 We've dealt recently -- and in 2006 we spent
- 12 three-quarters of a million dollars, which for us is a
- 13 very large amount of money, because our population --
- 14 while our city is large, our population is only around
- 15 14,000. So three-quarters of a million dollars for an
- 16 investment in anything is very heavy. And that was an
- 17 attempt to bring our wastewater treatment plant sludge
- 18 into compliance so that we could generate fertilizer from
- 19 it. That has been delayed through CEQA problems.
- 20 Which, by the way, we're the home of the desert
- 21 tortoise. And you can't even -- you can't put a swing set
- 22 up in my town basically without CEQA compliance and having
- 23 to make sure there's no burrowing owls or desert tortoises
- 24 in your area.
- We have been bringing that progressively on line

- 1 and we seek to enhance that in future years.
- 2 And so if you have any other questions, I'd be
- 3 happy to answer them.
- 4 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: No questions, thank you.
- 5 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: No questions. But good
- 6 luck with the desert tortoise. But it sounds like you're
- 7 on the right track and doing a great job. I applaud you
- 8 and thank you very much for being here.
- 9 MR. BEVINS: Thank you.
- 10 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 11 CHIEF MORGAN: Thank you.
- 12 And staff will be submitting edits to page seven
- 13 and eight to reflect the new dates. Staff will continue
- 14 to monitor the city very closely to ensure that that C&D
- 15 ordinance does get passed.
- And I do want to say, as Howard mentioned, some
- 17 of our cities didn't have the same level of assistance
- 18 over the past few years. And as a result of the
- 19 reorganization, we've rededicated staff. And the team of
- 20 Jill and Melissa assigned to this jurisdiction, they've
- 21 already done so much. So I'm very encouraged that we're
- 22 on the right track going forward.
- The next city is the city of Bell Gardens. And
- 24 I'd like to acknowledge the team that's worked with this
- 25 city closely. And that is Joe Rasmussen and Primo Nunez.

- 1 Raise your hand, please.
- 2 The city has fully implemented all of its
- 3 programs, including residential curbside, commercial
- 4 on-site pickup, and outreach support programs. However,
- 5 the city noted challenges working with the residential
- 6 hauler in 2005, as the hauler's financial difficulties led
- 7 to decreased performance. To address these challenges,
- 8 the city took action consistent with the limits imposed on
- 9 them by their contract requirements to correct hauler
- 10 performance.
- In December 2007, the hauler discontinued
- 12 services within the city. And a hauler that owns and
- 13 operates a successful MRF acquired the city's residential
- 14 hauling contract. After the change, diversion increased
- 15 and disposal decreased, for which we're very pleased to
- 16 see.
- 17 Although the residential program did suffer in
- 18 2005 and 2006, staff feel that the city took appropriate
- 19 action to correct the problem in dealing and addressing,
- 20 and creating an effective residential diversion program,
- 21 we feel, and are seeing it now in place.
- 22 So with that said, there is a representative from
- 23 the city present should you have any questions.
- 24 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you.
- 25 Would the city representative like to come forth

- 1 and make any comments or just answer questions?
- 2 MR. OROPEZA: Good morning. My name is John
- 3 Oropeza. I'm Public Works Director for the city of Bell
- 4 Gardens. And I'm here with are Waste Management
- 5 Consultant, Kim Nilsson.
- 6 And we'd just like to say that we're excited
- 7 about the new programs we're implementing, and we
- 8 anticipate being able to bring our diversion rates back up
- 9 to the 50 percent level. And with our new hauler starting
- 10 on January 1st, a green waste program has been added for
- 11 the residential side. And my C&D policy is in effect in
- 12 conjunction with our Building and Community Development
- 13 Department. And also I just recently got approved
- 14 administratively to implement an environmentally
- 15 preferable or recycled products purchasing policy for all
- 16 city departments. So we're very excited about those
- 17 additions.
- 18 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Very good. Thank you for
- 19 being here.
- Okay. Let's continue.
- 21 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 22 CHIEF MORGAN: Okay. The next city is the city of
- 23 Lawndale. The team that has worked closely with this city
- 24 is Amalia Fernandez and Primo Nunez.
- 25 Raise your hands, please.

- 1 Thanks.
- 2 The city has fully implemented programs including
- 3 improvements to the residential recycling and green waste
- 4 collection program, commercial recovery programs, an
- 5 ordinance for construction and demolition debris recovery,
- 6 and many education outreach projects targeted at the
- 7 community and schools.
- 8 The city's diversion rate exceeded 50 percent in
- 9 2005. And while disposal did increase in 2006, the city
- 10 suspects incorrect disposal reporting by an unpermitted
- 11 hauler. The city was not able to get full cooperation
- 12 with the hauler to correct the reporting errors. The city
- 13 will be addressing disposal modifications in 2007 to
- 14 further address the issue.
- 15 All of the city's programs are being implemented
- 16 effectively based upon staff visits with the city.
- 17 And there is a representative here today.
- 18 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you, Cara.
- 19 Would the representative like to make any
- 20 comments before the Committee?
- 21 MS. MORRIS: Good morning, Madam Chair, members
- 22 of the Board. Yes, my name is Debbie Morris. I'm the
- 23 city solid waste consultant.
- 24 And as the representative stated, we have had --
- 25 one of the major issues in the city of Lawndale has always

- 1 been misallocation of waste. And it has continued to be a
- 2 problem. One of the haulers I have unsuccessfully tried
- 3 to get reports from for the last 15 months and still have
- 4 not been able to gather those reports for the misallocated
- 5 waste.
- 6 Additionally, on a more positive note, I did want
- 7 to tell you that the city has -- they've started a green
- 8 team, and also they're going back to more of a grass-roots
- 9 recycling mode where we're going out and we're visiting
- 10 community organizations, senior organizations,
- 11 neighborhood watches. We're going to start a -- we're
- 12 looking into starting a pilot program in the multi-family
- 13 arena.
- 14 The residential diversion has actually not been a
- 15 problem. It's been between 44 and 56 percent. And also
- 16 since we've been doing this grass-roots recycling effort,
- 17 in the last four months we've increased the residential
- 18 diversion rate by ten percentage points. We are tracking
- 19 it pounds per household per month every single month, so
- 20 that we can make sure -- we can see what's working, what's
- 21 not working. So if something isn't working, we want to
- 22 make sure we're putting that resource and effort toward
- 23 programs that will work.
- 24 The commercial sector has been our problem, as
- 25 with some other cities, what they have stated. They're

- 1 all really small mom-and-pop businesses in the city, and
- 2 coupled with a very old infrastructure where there isn't
- 3 room for bins behind the businesses.
- 4 So we have started -- the city of Lawndale has
- 5 started a commercial -- a free commercial recycling
- 6 program that's offered to the businesses. And our
- 7 company, we actually call at least ten businesses per
- 8 month to see if we can entice them to join the program.
- 9 The contracts will be ending -- the solid waste
- 10 contracts will be ending in December 2009. They'll
- 11 probably be extended till 2010. This coincides with a
- 12 five-year notice that we -- that was given to the nine
- 13 permitted commercial haulers in the city. And the thought
- 14 is that we'll either combine -- that's been the problem.
- 15 And so we'll either combine and have one contract which
- 16 we'll have one franchised hauler, which will do
- 17 residential and commercial, or we'll have two franchised
- 18 haulers, one for commercial, one for residential. That
- 19 way the city can really get ahold of that commercial
- 20 sector, which we really haven't had a lot of luck doing so
- 21 far. So that's our hope.
- 22 So thank you again for letting me speak today.
- 23 And I appreciate your time. And I also want to really say
- 24 how much I appreciate -- I've worked with Steve Uselton
- 25 and Primitivo Nunez for the last few years. And they have

1 always been so incredibly helpful, always responsive, and

- 2 I really appreciate that.
- 3 Thank you.
- 4 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you. Thank you for your
- 5 comments.
- 6 Okay. Let's move on.
- 7 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 8 CHIEF MORGAN: Thank you.
- 9 City of Malibu is next. And the team working
- 10 with the city is Danielle Aslam and Jennifer Wallin, who
- 11 just had a baby. She's home with baby.
- 12 Danielle, thank you.
- 13 The city has fully implemented their programs and
- 14 really gone above and beyond. But I'd like to talk a
- 15 little bit about some of the challenges that they've
- 16 faced.
- 17 Despite many of their issues involving tourism
- 18 and disposal misallocation that influence the city's
- 19 achievement of the 50 percent diversion rate, the city
- 20 continues to identify program efforts and strategize to
- 21 further expand and enhance their programs.
- 22 Nine million tourists visit this city annually.
- 23 And the transient nature of this community makes it very
- 24 difficult to enforce a recycling program. In addition,
- 25 the adjustment factors used in calculating the city's

- 1 diversion rate do not account for tourism. Hence, one of
- 2 those other benefits of moving to a new measurement
- 3 system.
- 4 Furthermore, the boundary of the Malibu zip code
- 5 encompasses an area more than three times the size of the
- 6 city, often resulting in the misallocation of waste to
- 7 Malibu. The city has worked with the county waste hauler
- 8 to improve reporting. But south haul misreporting
- 9 continues. And I can tell you that when the city sent us
- 10 information to prepare for this, we had a stack about this
- 11 big addressing some of their misallocation issues. And
- 12 it's a real challenge for them.
- 13 There is a city representative here today to
- 14 speak a little bit to the city's programs.
- 15 MS. NILSSON: Good morning, Chair and Committee
- 16 members. My name is Kimberly Nilsson. I'm the Solid
- 17 Waste Coordinator for the city of Malibu. And I'd like to
- 18 thank Cara and Steve and their team for all their help.
- 19 We all have a fantastic relationship.
- 20 I'd also like to thank them for considering
- 21 Malibu's issues. All of our programs were mandatory.
- 22 They're in by resolution. They're all in place, but it's
- 23 a very difficult waste stream to get a handle on.
- 24 But beyond that, I just wanted to let you know
- 25 that the city, through the Building and Safety Department,

- 1 has established a green team that will start from the
- 2 building industry to the C&D. All of that is being
- 3 encompassed in environmental purchases. The city also has
- 4 always made environmental purchases. We've used
- 5 rubberized asphalt since after the fires in '93. All
- 6 different types of materials are used. They use recycled
- 7 paper. They duplex everything. But it was never a
- 8 written policy. So we wrote up an agenda item that was
- 9 supposed to go last week. And the city clerk said, "No,
- 10 No. We can just put that in our policy manual." So it's
- 11 off and into the policy manual as a document that the city
- 12 has to live by. So it won't be an ordinance but it will
- 13 be in the city's operational manual that all the
- 14 departments will comply with.
- 15 We love our community. We love it to be green.
- 16 We do have some issues, but we really do look forward to
- 17 the new disposal reporting method and the way it's being
- 18 done. We think it's going to more accurately show what
- 19 our community's doing.
- 20 And thank you so much for your time. And welcome
- 21 to our area.
- 22 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you. Thank you for your
- 23 comments.
- 24 Cara.
- 25 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

- 1 CHIEF MORGAN: City of Norwalk is next. And Ed Reidhead
- 2 and Primo Nunez have been the team working with the city.
- 3 The city has fully implemented programs,
- 4 including expansion of residential recycling and green
- 5 waste and commercial recovery programs. They've adopted a
- 6 construction and demolition ordinance and are implementing
- 7 that ordinance. And they've also expanded outreach and
- 8 education to the community and schools.
- 9 The city passed its commercial -- I mean, its
- 10 construction and demolition ordinance in May 2005. And
- 11 this really helped to reduce disposal in 2006. And we're
- 12 very encouraged, preliminary 2007 disposal information
- 13 identifies a large drop in disposal. So they're doing a
- 14 great job.
- 15 And there is a city representative here today, I
- 16 believe.
- 17 MR. GARCIA: Good morning, Madam Chair, Committee
- 18 members. I'm Ernie Garcia, City Manager, city of Norwalk.
- 19 And I'd just like to, first of all, thank the
- 20 staff that has worked very closely with our staff in
- 21 getting us close to compliance. I addressed the Board
- 22 last year in Sacramento indicating our population,
- 23 strictly residential, very small commercial. We have
- 24 great challenges. But with the staff's effort in working
- 25 with us, we are getting very close to compliance.

1 As you can see in the report, we have implemented

- 2 almost everything that you had suggested. And all those
- 3 programs are working. But with the efforts of our trash
- 4 haulers we have two we feel very comfortable that
- 5 we'll be able to get as close as possible to that
- 6 compliance.
- 7 Thank you.
- 8 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for being here and
- 9 your comments. We appreciate it.
- 10 Cara.
- 11 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 12 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: We'll tag team now.
- 13 I'll take a few.
- 14 The next jurisdiction in the list is Rolling
- 15 Hills, County of Los Angeles. And our staff on this is
- 16 Amalia Fernandez and Primo Nunez.
- Thanks.
- 18 This is a city that's adequately implemented its
- 19 plan programs, and its diversion rate did exceed 50
- 20 percent in the years 2000 through 2004. Disposal did
- 21 increase in 2005 and 6. But there were a couple of very
- 22 distinct disposal reporting issues. And this is a theme
- 23 that you've already heard several this morning and you're
- 24 going to hear again.
- In this case, one involved a transfer station

1 misallocation of green waste. And then there was another

- 2 waste missed allocation. In both cases, the city was not
- 3 able to get the full cooperation of the hauler to correct
- 4 the reporting errors. Without the suspected
- 5 misallocation, the city's rate would have been 53 percent.
- 6 So, this issue of misallocation, as a side bar,
- 7 one of the reasons why in our original proposals for SB
- 8 1016 we had suggested going to countywide disposal
- 9 reporting with still individual jurisdiction performance
- 10 and responsibility. It would have simplified a lot of
- 11 this. So we will continue to just keep that on the table
- 12 at least.
- But at any rate, the city of Rolling Hills we do
- 14 feel has implemented its programs and warrants a
- 15 good-faith effort.
- 16 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: All right.
- 17 Thank you, Madam Chair and Member Brown. We
- 18 appreciate your consideration of our good-faith effort to
- 19 implement and achieve our diversion and recycling goals.
- 20 MR. DAHLERBRUCH: My name is Tony Dahlerbruch.
- 21 I'm the City Manager with the city of Rolling Hills.
- 22 And I also want to thank the staff, Steve
- 23 Primitivo and Amalia, who I've been working with and
- 24 they've been great.
- I can just add a couple things to the staff

- 1 report. First, I do want to assure you that the city's
- 2 very environmentally sensitive and we're committed to
- 3 recycling and diversion.
- 4 Second, the city of Rolling Hills is about three
- 5 square miles. It's only residential. There's about 680
- 6 homes. They're all single family. And with that, we have
- 7 one trash hauler, Allied Waste, who is here with me today.
- 8 We're all very committed to achieving these goals. And
- 9 we're in constant contact with them daily to try to deal
- 10 with this situation.
- 11 The problem, as has been referenced, is our
- 12 disposal tonnage, is our construction and demolition
- 13 waste. We're addressing it in a couple different ways.
- 14 First, we're now going to be getting weekly reports from
- 15 Allied from, in particular, Puente Hills, who's dumping
- 16 there. And so we can immediately talk to those haulers
- 17 and correct misallocations.
- 18 Second of all, this next month, we will have a
- 19 new solid waste ordinance going to the city council. We
- 20 met with our council subcommittee just recently. And it
- 21 will be on the council agenda this next month. And that
- 22 includes a C&D provision as well.
- We appreciate your support. Thank you.
- 24 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for being here and
- 25 thank you for your comments. We appreciate it.

- 1 Howard.
- 2 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 3 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Next is the city of
- 4 San Gabriel in L.A. County. Staff on this has been Will
- 5 Carpenter with Jennifer Wallin.
- 6 Thanks, Will.
- 7 San Gabriel had an SB 1066 time extension, and
- 8 it's fully implemented the programs that were required in
- 9 that extension. These include a pay as you throw, a
- 10 system for residential waste, expanded curbside green
- 11 waste collection, a C&D recovery ordinance, improved MRF
- 12 recovery rates, and some residual waste processing through
- 13 one of the transformation facilities.
- 14 The city also does have misallocation issues; and
- 15 again, as with Rolling hills, has been unable to, you
- 16 know, fully document those issues, as noted in more detail
- 17 on the attachment. A lot of the misallocation results
- 18 from the complexity of the city boundaries, which are
- 19 intertwined and share zip codes with some of the
- 20 surrounding unincorporated areas. They have similar
- 21 street names and patterns. So it's very difficult to
- 22 document these kinds of misallocations. But it could be
- 23 affecting the diversion rate for by as much as 15 percent.
- 24 Another great example for countywide reporting.
- 25 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Keep plugging.

- 1 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 2 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: I will. But that
- 3 will be the last time today.
- 4 (Laughter.)
- 5 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 6 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: And I'm not sure if
- 7 anyone from the jurisdiction wishes to make any comments.
- 8 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: We do have a Steve.
- 9 MR. PRESTON: Good morning, Madam Chairman,
- 10 Committee Member Brown. Thank you for the opportunity to
- 11 speak on behalf of the city of San Gabriel.
- 12 My name is Steve Preston. I'm the Deputy City
- 13 Manager. Joining me today is Michelle Leonard, Vice
- 14 President of SCS Engineers, who assists us in meeting our
- 15 diversion targets.
- 16 We would particularly like to thank Jennifer
- 17 Wallin of your staff and Will Carpenter, and congratulate
- 18 Jennifer on the new arrival. She has always been an
- 19 extraordinary resource for us. We were so grateful to
- 20 have her assisting us. And we suspect you're equally
- 21 grateful to have her as a member of your team.
- Thank you.
- 23 San Gabriel is seeking a good-faith-effort
- 24 designation on the basis of a long and collaborative
- 25 effort by the city; its franchise hauler, Athens Services;

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

1 and our residents to increase diversion rates. Despite an

- 2 outstanding program, which includes full MRF'ing of
- 3 residential and commercial waste, we have hovered around a
- 4 49 percent diversion rate. Because the city shares its
- 5 corporate name with a large unincorporated area and is in
- 6 a valley of the same name more than 20 miles in length
- 7 with about a million people, we found our diversion rate
- 8 challenged from time to time by significant misreporting.
- 9 For the past several years San Gabriel has
- 10 annually audited its landfill reports to determine
- 11 compliance with the Board standards. This time-consuming
- 12 process has repeatedly revealed substantial inaccuracies
- 13 that we've been able to correct with the Board's
- 14 assistance.
- 15 We would like, however, to focus on some programs
- 16 that the city's initiating that we're very pleased with.
- 17 Some of those were already referenced in the staff report.
- 18 In addition to citywide education outreach, improvements
- 19 to our codes, a new C&D ordinance, improvements in our
- 20 waste hauling programs, a new program for the purchasing
- 21 of recycled materials for which our city engineer can
- 22 supply data, an on-site E-waste collection at the city
- 23 yard, we're pleased to announce that next week we expect
- 24 the city council to adopt a pilot program for citywide
- 25 E-waste recycling curbside pickup.

1 We are very eager to pursue the Waste Management

- 2 Board's objectives. And having recently adopted a green
- 3 building strategy in key commercial areas, we're now in
- 4 the process of revising all of our development codes, and
- 5 expect over the next two years to make substantial changes
- 6 that will further enhance our ability to divert and
- 7 recycle waste materials.
- 8 As always, San Gabriel remains committed to
- 9 successfully meeting and advancing the State's objectives.
- 10 We're always available if you have any questions or would
- 11 like to explore new methods with us. We're looking
- 12 forward to participating in the development of additional
- 13 voluntary methods that Jennifer has suggested.
- 14 And we're happy to answer any questions you may
- 15 have.
- 16 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for being here. We
- 17 appreciate your comments. Thank you.
- 18 Howard.
- 19 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 20 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Next is Orange
- 21 unincorporated, obviously in the County of Orange. And
- 22 our staff on this are Maria Kakutani Maria, raise your
- 23 hand with Keir Furey supervising.
- Orange County -- Orange unincorporated also
- 25 implemented its SB 1066 time extension programs. It

- 1 amended all -- among other things, it amended all of its
- 2 solid waste franchise agreements to include a 50 percent
- 3 diversion requirement, expanded public outreach and annual
- 4 waste audits for commercial accounts and commercial
- 5 recycling outreach.
- 6 Even so, the -- excuse me -- I mean the aggregate
- 7 diversion rate for residential and commercial went from 36
- 8 percent in 2006 to an estimated 42 percent in 2007.
- 9 Disposal went down in 2007 by about 21 percent. So that's
- 10 quite impressive.
- 11 The unincorporated area is a difficult area. It
- 12 encompasses nine areas that are kind of islands of
- 13 unincorporated areas that are in -- that basically the
- 14 incorporated cities didn't want to annex. So it's a
- 15 difficult situation to work in. And they have five
- 16 franchised haulers.
- 17 The county's established a system to review each
- 18 hauler's performance. And if it determines that the
- 19 hauler has not provided adequate justification for not
- 20 meeting the 50 percent diversion rates, the county can
- 21 impose fines.
- To date, we're aware that at least two haulers
- 23 are under this sort of -- they call it their own
- 24 good-faith-effort standing.
- 25 So I believe Orange County unincorporated has a

- 1 PowerPoint that it wishes to make a presentation with.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Yes. So if you would come
- 3 forward. I have Dylan Wright.
- 4 (Thereupon an overhead presentation was
- 5 presented as follows.)
- 6 MR. WRIGHT: Thank you, Madam Chair. Dylan
- 7 Wright, Director of Government Community Relations for OC
- 8 Waste and Recycling. I'm glad to be before you today
- 9 to -- it sounds like I'm going to recap a little bit of
- 10 what Mr. Levenson said. But just the same, we think
- 11 it's -- we've got some exciting stuff going on and we
- 12 wanted to share it.
- 13 Also, thanks to Maria Kakutani, Keir Furey, and
- 14 Tara Gauthier for all of their assistance and guidance.
- 15 It's very much appreciated.
- 16 --00o--
- 17 MR. WRIGHT: For 2006 -- this is kind of a look
- 18 at the timeframe in question -- we were at 39 percent
- 19 diversion. As was said, in 2007 we expect about 42
- 20 percent. Currently, we're estimating about 44 to 45
- 21 percent.
- We've got 38 programs implemented to date. And
- 23 one of the things that we are excited about is, in
- 24 addition to focusing programs on incorporated areas, as
- 25 also Mr. Levenson mentioned earlier, we're looking at

1 possible synergies with the local jurisdictions within the

- 2 county. So all of the cities, we're implementing programs
- 3 that will help not only us but them as well.
- 4 --000--
- 5 MR. WRIGHT: And some of those I'll talk about.
- 6 A lot of these were implemented -- or initiated in 2006,
- 7 either are ongoing or were implemented.
- 8 As was mentioned, we have strengthened our
- 9 franchise agreement terms and conditions, and also
- 10 assigned a short term to those extensions, which were done
- 11 in 2000 -- excuse me -- effective 2007. So they'll be
- 12 expiring in 2010. We wanted to be able to be agile: In
- 13 the event that certain things were working, continue them.
- 14 And if not, then to try something else.
- 15 For our commercial and multi-family recycling,
- 16 for example, it's mandated. All commercial and
- 17 multi-family -- all bin waste must be processed at a MRF.
- 18 And, in addition, free containers must be offered to all
- 19 customers.
- We have a 50 percent diversion requirement, as
- 21 was mentioned, that either come -- you know, if not met,
- 22 then, just as we're doing here today, the hauler has the
- 23 opportunity to present information to get a good-faith
- 24 effort per se or incur a monetary penalty.
- 25 Also, we have required green waste for both bin

- 1 and cart service.
- 2 One of the -- oh, and as a component too, public
- 3 education is required. And the reason I bring that up
- 4 here under the franchise agreements is we have also a
- 5 countywide regional campaign that we've put together that
- 6 we will -- that our haulers will also be a part of.
- 7 --000--
- 8 MR. WRIGHT: Continuing, then we also have a
- 9 construction -- have implemented a construction and
- 10 demolition policy. Our board of supervisors has approved
- 11 that. We've teamed with the planning department, so that
- 12 through the permitting process we can ensure that at least
- 13 in an unincorporated county, which is pretty slow, believe
- 14 it or not, any projects are required to divert at least 50
- 15 percent.
- 16 Also, the Board has approved an environmental
- 17 purchasing and procurement policy. And in tandem with
- 18 that they authorized or directed the establishment of a
- 19 green task force. And part of the task force's
- 20 responsibility is to return within one year with an
- 21 environmentally preferable purchasing policy best
- 22 practices manual, which will be implemented by all county
- 23 departments and agencies.
- 24 --000--
- MR. WRIGHT: We've also expanded our recycling on

- 1 the Go Program to include additional county parks
- 2 facilities and we're working with probation to get
- 3 recycling containers in their facilities as well.
- 4 And then the more regional initiatives, giving
- 5 the bigger picture, we're -- as I said, the synergies.
- 6 Through our surcharge, which has been very successful not
- 7 only for all jurisdictions but for us, we've realized a 30
- 8 percent reduction in self-haul waste in the unincorporated
- 9 county alone. I think it's more like 60 percent
- 10 countywide. That's been quite successful.
- 11 And as a result of the revenues gained from that
- 12 surcharge, we're working on our outreach and -- our public
- 13 education outreach campaign, regional campaign, with the
- 14 uniform message. And one of the things I wanted to
- 15 mention today, it includes a component of outreach to
- 16 school age children. We think it's very important to get
- 17 the kids involved young. They'll get their parents
- 18 involved. And so that will be done regionally. It will
- 19 be done throughout the county.
- 20 And we're working to establish a partnership with
- 21 the Discovery Science Center, which they see about
- 22 500,000 -- they have about 500,000 visitors a year. And
- 23 they have school-specific programs that meet the State
- 24 criteria for curriculum. And so we're very glad to be
- 25 working with them. We're going to get into the

- 1 classrooms.
- 2 Let's see. Conversion technology initiatives,
- 3 we're trying to look forward as well in this respect. We
- 4 have a feasibility study, but it's currently out. We're
- 5 recruiting for a contract. We expect to award the
- 6 contract in January '09. And that will be to take a look
- 7 and see if it's possible to site a conversion technology
- 8 facility on one of our current or active or closed
- 9 landfill sites within the county.
- 10 We also have a partnership -- conversion
- 11 technology partnership program planned, which would be
- 12 open to private developers who want to establish such
- 13 technologies. And one of the -- well, there are a few
- 14 criteria. But one of those would be that it must qualify
- 15 for a diversion credit.
- 16 Our Regional Recycling and Diversion Grant
- 17 Program, we've done that last year, we're doing that this
- 18 year.
- 19 Disposal reporting system upgrade. As others
- 20 have mentioned, misallocation is an issue. This plans to
- 21 be -- or purposes to be more transparent and also will
- 22 incorporate our local LEA requirements for MRFs. So we
- 23 will have all -- the ideal -- the MRFs will be reporting
- 24 to the same place where the tonnage is reported for us for
- 25 the landfills, so that we'll be able to cross-check and

- 1 verify.
- 2 Also, the Material Recovery Facility we have
- 3 planned for the southern portion of Orange County, which
- 4 to date has not had a Material Recovery Facility open to
- 5 the public.
- 6 And we hope to bring the nondisposal facility
- 7 amendment -- element amendment to your Board for approval
- 8 in March. We're working also with our local LEA on
- 9 permitting that facility at this time.
- 10 --00o--
- MR. WRIGHT: And then other efforts, just getting
- 12 buy-in from the most important people. Our board of
- 13 supervisors are very supportive of efforts and we're
- 14 providing them with regular status reports -- quarterly
- 15 status reports. And that's really helped to obtain buy-in
- 16 for a lot of projects.
- We also have established a waste industry
- 18 technical advisory committee, where we meet with haulers
- 19 and others in the waste industry locally to discuss issues
- 20 and try to come up with solutions together; regular
- 21 meetings with our Waste Management Commission, which is
- 22 also our local task force; bimonthly recycling coordinator
- 23 meetings with all jurisdictions within the county; and
- 24 also we meet quarterly with our franchise haulers to make
- 25 sure things are going as planned.

- 1 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Great. Sounds like you
- 2 covered a lot of ground there in Orange County. Good.
- 3 Thank you for being here, Dylan.
- 4 MR. WRIGHT: Thank you.
- 5 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Howard.
- 6 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 7 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Thanks, Dylan.
- 8 Next is the city of Calimesa in Riverside County.
- 9 Our staff on this are Maria Kakutani and Keir Furey.
- 10 This is another city that had traditionally
- 11 exceeded the 50 percent diversion rate from 2001 through
- 12 2004, but its rate dropped in 2005 and 2006. In this
- 13 case, it was due primarily to construction of three new
- 14 subdivisions. They did implement programs to divert a lot
- 15 of the waste from the -- C&D waste from those projects and
- 16 achieved a 62 percent diversion in those projects. But
- 17 they still had waste that was going to landfill, and that
- 18 impacted their diversion rate.
- 19 This is a case where only 146 tons impacts your
- 20 rate by one percent. So the city did actively divert as
- 21 much as it could. And it has implemented all of its 1066
- 22 time extension requirements, including residential
- 23 curbside, commercial on-site pickup, adoption of a C&D
- 24 ordinance, and educational outreach. And as a result, its
- 25 disposal dropped 17 percent between 2006 and 2007, so that

- 1 is definitely going in the right direction.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you.
- 3 Is there anyone here that would wish to address
- 4 the Committee?
- 5 MR. FARRION: Good morning, Madam Chair and
- 6 members of the Committee. David Farrion. I'm the
- 7 President of CR&R's Waste and Recycling Division. And
- 8 along with my staff here, we have Bob French, the Director
- 9 of Public Works from the city. And I just wanted to cover
- 10 a few things just to let you know how we are working
- 11 together, not only with your staff, but with the city's
- 12 staff as well.
- 13 Commercial recycling continues to be a big focus
- 14 for us. And we've, over the last couple months, audited
- 15 the entire city, their accounts, and implemented many new
- 16 programs. And that's through an effort of our recycling
- 17 coordinators along with the city staff.
- 18 We basically made three types of programs
- 19 available to those customers a separated fiber program,
- 20 a mixed commingled program, and in some cases green waste.
- 21 In regards to C&D diversion, again that continues
- 22 to be a big focus of ours. That's a city that's
- 23 definitely going to grow as we move out of the recession.
- 24 And currently we are diverting well over 75 percent at our
- 25 facility. And with some new technology that we're going

- 1 to be implementing, we anticipate that number going up as
- 2 well.
- 3 As I mentioned, we do have dedicated recycling
- 4 coordinators that are working in that city as well as all
- 5 our other cities.
- 6 Expansion of our facility, that's underway.
- 7 We're in the permitting process now. And we did just
- 8 receive a grant from DOR for some advanced technology at
- 9 that facility. So we're excited about that.
- 10 And, finally, as the staff said, we have seen a
- 11 dramatic reduction in the disposal for the city, which we
- 12 believe will move it above 50 percent as we move into the
- 13 years to come.
- 14 So that's a quick report. If there's any
- 15 questions I could answer, I'd be happy to.
- 16 Thank you.
- 17 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you very much for being
- 18 here. And I appreciate your comments. Thank you.
- 19 Howard.
- 20 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 21 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Thank you.
- Next is the city of Desert Hot Springs in
- 23 Riverside. And our staff on this are Tara Gauthier and
- 24 Keir Furey.
- 25 Tara, if you can raise your hand.

- 1 Now, this is a city that's had a few problems.
- 2 It's had financial, political, and staffing difficulties.
- 3 It had to go into bankruptcy and dismiss a city manager.
- 4 But despite that, the city has implemented the feasible
- 5 programs that were included in its SB 1066 time extension.
- 6 It's adopted a C&D ordinance; it's established residential
- 7 curbside drop-off programs; enhanced its school curriculum
- 8 programs; instituted government recycling; and it's also
- 9 got some economic incentives related to disposal tonnage
- 10 going.
- 11 It did not implement a couple of programs that
- 12 were in the 1066 extension. These included an in-vessel
- 13 green waste and food composting program, and the
- 14 construction of a MRF. The MRF is dependent on the
- 15 permitting process, and that's been beyond the city's
- 16 control and has taken longer than anticipated. And then
- 17 it was also later decided that the in-vessel composting
- 18 really was not going to be part of that process. But it
- 19 did implement the feasible programs. And in 2006,
- 20 disposal increased to below the level that it had been in
- 21 2003, and diversion improved from 17 percent in 2004 to 44
- 22 percent in 2006. So we believe this is worthy of a
- 23 good-faith effort.
- I see we have representatives --
- 25 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you, Howard.

- 1 We do have two speaker slips here.
- 2 So first I will call Rick Daniels -- or actually
- 3 Russell Betts.
- 4 MR. BETTS: Thank you, Madam Chair and
- 5 Commission. My name is Russell Betts. I'm a city
- 6 councilman for the city of Desert Hot Springs. I'm here
- 7 on behalf of our city and our city council to assure you
- 8 that each member of our council is committed to achieving
- 9 compliance. To ask for that obviously is our city
- 10 manager, who I'll introduce now Rick Daniels.
- 11 MR. DANIELS: Thank you.
- 12 The troubles of Desert Hot Springs are well
- 13 documented, and I thank the staff for bringing those out
- 14 again.
- 15 (Laughter.)
- MR. DANIELS: Bankruptcy is certainly no fun, nor
- 17 is the high turnover in the chair that I currently set in.
- 18 But with very limited resources in the city, which has the
- 19 lowest per capita income in the Inland Empire, Desert Hot
- 20 Springs with a new city council is making its very best
- 21 effort to put a green imprint on the future city.
- The city is about 80 percent undeveloped. So we
- 23 are focusing a lot of our efforts on construction and
- 24 demolition waste, that at such time as the economy does
- 25 turn around, that we will have programs in place.

- We have mandatory service single-stream
- 2 recycling, quarterly bilingual newsletters. We are also
- 3 adding five additional newsletters this next year, and
- 4 every one of them will have a component dealing with
- 5 recycling and waste reduction.
- 6 For the benefit of all those waiting to get their
- 7 community in front of you, I'll end my comments. And
- 8 thank you.
- 9 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Good. Thank you both for
- 10 being here. And we understand your struggles. So we
- 11 appreciate your continued commitment to the AB 939
- 12 mandate.
- 13 Thank you.
- 14 Howard.
- 15 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 16 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Madam Chair, we're
- 17 now a little bit over halfway through the item. We've
- 18 reached a little over 50 percent implementation of the
- 19 item.
- 20 (Laughter.)
- 21 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 22 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Sorry.
- 23 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Since we're striving to
- 24 exceed 50 percent, let's continue.
- 25 (Laughter.)

- 1 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 2 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Okay. Does the
- 3 court reporter need a break?
- 4 You're fine. Okay.
- 5 So we'll just keep going.
- 6 I'm going to turn it over to Cara right now.
- 7 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 8 CHIEF MORGAN: The next city is the city of Moreno Valley.
- 9 And Rob Baumann and Keir Furey are the team that worked
- 10 with the city.
- 11 The year 2000 marked the beginning of a steep
- 12 increase in population growth for the city of Moreno
- 13 Valley, which led to a huge increase in disposal. Even
- 14 with the rapid population growth, disposal tonnage for
- 15 2006 was down from 2005. And we're pleased to note that
- 16 this downward trend in disposal has continued, as
- 17 preliminary 2007 disposal reporting system data is showing
- 18 even more significant decrease since 2006.
- 19 We believe this is as a result of the city fully
- 20 implementing their diversion programs, including
- 21 residential curbside, expansion of commercial on-site
- 22 pickup, the adoption and implementation of their C&D
- 23 construction and demolition ordinance, and biomass
- 24 diversion as well as educational outreach.
- 25 So there is a city representative here.

- 1 MR. LEMON: And good morning, Madam Chair and
- 2 Committee Member Brown. My name's Robert Lemon with the
- 3 city of Moreno Valley. I'm the Public Works Program
- 4 Manager. And with me is Julie Reyes with Waste Management
- 5 of the Inland Empire, who is the city's exclusive
- 6 franchise waste hauler.
- 7 To add to what the staff report had indicated,
- 8 and the city's very pleased at that downward trend that we
- 9 are experiencing. And I also want to thank very much Keir
- 10 Furey and Rob Baumann for working with us through the
- 11 process.
- 12 One of the items in working through the reporting
- 13 process that we were able to highlight was an opportunity
- 14 to enhance our commercial recycling plan. And we actually
- 15 were able to successfully implement a four-pronged
- 16 strategy in order to enhance that. We focused on trying
- 17 to improve recycling data acquisition and monitoring, as
- 18 well as improving some of our marketing outreach.
- 19 Our waste hauler was a very good partner with
- 20 that, reaching out to our top 100 waste generators,
- 21 commercial customers and offering them free bin service
- 22 for 90 days. And we've already seen positive results in
- 23 terms of our overall commercial accounts that have
- 24 recycling service, having increased by 17 percent in just
- 25 the three months that we've implemented this action plan.

- 1 And we'll continue to further work with those customers
- 2 and some of the smaller generators as well.
- 3 The third prong of the strategy was to include
- 4 some operational improvements with our waste hauler
- 5 retraining of their staff.
- 6 And also something that we're very excited about
- 7 is working directly with the school district. The city of
- 8 Moreno Valley has two school districts, one of which, the
- 9 larger, has more than 50 schools. And our waste hauler's
- 10 been working with them to develop a pilot program for a
- 11 wet-dry route and is personally meeting with custodial
- 12 staff of each one of the schools to roll that out. And
- 13 that's a very successful program that we're really excited
- 14 about.
- 15 And, lastly, we did also look at staff to
- 16 improvements. We have an additional staff member that's
- 17 been added that's solely dedicated to educational
- 18 outreach, as well as working with the school districts,
- 19 commercial recycling, illegal haulers, and enhancing our
- 20 C&D program implementation.
- 21 So with all of those programs, we're looking to
- 22 continue that downward trend. And both myself and Julie
- 23 are available for any questions.
- 24 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for being here,
- 25 Robert and Julie as well. Look forward to seeing that

- 1 downward disposal trend continue. So thank you.
- 2 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 3 CHIEF MORGAN: City of Murrieta. The team again working
- 4 with this city is Rob and Keir.
- 5 The city has fully implemented its time extension
- 6 programs including commercial on-site pickup, their
- 7 construction and demolition recycling program; they
- 8 adopted and are implementing their C&D ordinance; they
- 9 implemented a procurement policy; and they've been
- 10 expanding their educational outreach.
- 11 As a result of all of these programs, the city's
- 12 disposal has decreased since 2005. And 2007 preliminary
- 13 disposal data shows even more significant decrease. So
- 14 staff are really pleased. It looks like the programs are
- 15 working.
- 16 Additionally, the city and the hauler have worked
- 17 toward improving commercial recycling by encouraging
- 18 businesses to put internal recycling programs in place.
- 19 They're providing free waste assessments to provide
- 20 additional avenues for increased recycling opportunities
- 21 and requiring all large businesses to have cardboard
- 22 balers.
- So we do have a representative here today.
- 24 MS. DRIGGERS: Good morning. I'm Nancy Driggers,
- 25 Assistant to the City Manager for the city of Murrieta.

- I would just like to take this opportunity to
- 2 thank the Board staff, Rob Baumann, Keir Furey, for
- 3 assisting us and spending the time with us to make our
- $4\,$ programs work and to assist us in getting to where we are,
- 5 which I believe is 49 percent. We're very close. Not
- 6 quite there, but we'll continue to work towards that.
- 7 And thank you for the opportunity and the
- 8 recommendation for a good-faith effort.
- 9 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for being here,
- 10 Nancy. Appreciate it.
- 11 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 12 CHIEF MORGAN: City of Grand Terrace. The team working
- 13 with this city is Curie Canuela and Kristin Yee.
- 14 The city of Grand Terrace is approximately 3.6
- 15 square miles, with a population of 12,000, consisting of
- 16 4,000 households. Many of these residents live in mobile
- 17 home parks and multi-family residences. It's been very
- 18 challenging for the city to implement programs with some
- 19 of these residential kinds of challenges.
- 20 The city, however, continues to improve upon its
- 21 curbside collection. All mobile parks now have been
- 22 converted from community four-cubic-yard recycling bins to
- 23 individual recycling bins, which has brought in a cleaner
- 24 recycling stream.
- 25 Even with all the programs implemented, the city

- 1 saw a slight decrease in their diversion rate. In
- 2 mid-2007, the city negotiated a new franchise agreement
- 3 and changed to a hauler who has committed to a more
- 4 proactive public outreach and education program as well as
- 5 incentives to motivate residents to recycle.
- 6 Since the franchise agreement change, the city
- 7 has been working closely with its hauler to increase the
- 8 collection of recyclables.
- 9 Finally, to further address the commercial
- 10 sector, the hauler has implemented a select load route.
- 11 And there is a representative here today.
- MR. MERRILL: Good morning, Madam Chair. Lim
- 13 Merrill. I'm a consultant for the city of Grand Terrace.
- 14 And with me today is Matt Wirz with the city. We want to
- 15 express our appreciation to your staff for working with
- 16 us.
- 17 We would like to share with you that it is our
- 18 intent to be adopting a construction and demolition waste
- 19 ordinance in January, and that we are looking forward to
- 20 working with our hauler, Burrtec, in further implementing
- 21 our commercial recycling program. We know that that's one
- 22 of our areas that's a weakness. And we believe that we
- 23 can work very successfully to move those numbers up.
- 24 So thank you very much.
- 25 By the way, our City Manager, Steve Berry, sends

- 1 his greetings.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: We go way back, don't we,
- 3 Mark, with Steve.
- 4 Thank you.
- 5 Let's continue.
- 6 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 7 CHIEF MORGAN: The city of Highland. The team working
- 8 with the city is Curie and Kristin again.
- 9 During the time extension, the city expanded
- 10 their residential and multi-family recycling program, as
- 11 well as their education outreach program. The city's
- 12 haulers, Burrtec and Cal Disposal, have completed
- 13 switching the single-family collection routes to an
- 14 automated collection system. City staff has also expanded
- 15 its multi-family recycling program.
- 16 Burrtec is also conducting a pilot program at a
- 17 new senior apartment complex with good results. Burrtec
- 18 is also working on expanding its efforts related to the
- 19 commercial sector, and the city does require all new
- 20 commercial structures to include a recycling program as
- 21 part of their building permit.
- The city has been challenged with increasing
- 23 diversion from the older businesses that are smaller and
- 24 often have space constraints. To address this barrier,
- 25 the hauler will be implementing select load routes to

1 capture the dry materials and then sort the materials at

- 2 the MRF.
- 3 And we do have a representative here.
- 4 MS. MORGAN: Good morning, Madam Chair and Member
- 5 Brown. My name is Melissa Morgan. I am the Public
- 6 Services Manager with the city of Highland.
- 7 I'd just like to speak -- expand something that
- 8 staff had talked about. When we entered into our 1066
- 9 extension program, we entered into some very lengthy
- 10 renegotiation of our franchise agreements. After
- 11 successful negotiations, we in 2007 implemented an
- 12 automated collection program, which reduced the amount of
- 13 trash that was put out and made more of our residents have
- 14 the opportunity to recycle.
- In comparison of 2006 disposal amounts to 2007,
- 16 our trash disposal went down 9 percent, our recycled
- 17 materials went up 29 percent, and our green waste
- 18 materials went up 23 percent. So with that, we are very
- 19 eager to calculate our 2007 diversion amount.
- 20 And I can answer any questions if you'd like.
- 21 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Great job.
- MS. MORGAN: Thank you.
- 23 LOCAL ASSISTANCE & MARKET DEVELOPMENT DIVISION
- 24 CHIEF MORGAN: We'll be working on calculating their
- 25 disposal rate.

1 City of Needles. The team working with the city

- 2 is Diana Suarez-Arguelles and Melissa Vargas.
- 3 Thanks, guys.
- 4 The city has implemented all of its programs,
- 5 including business waste reduction, residential curbside
- 6 and drop-off, commercial on-site pickup, government
- 7 recycling, and electronic outreach media.
- 8 In 2004 there was an increase in disposal due to
- 9 a \$200,000 HUD Blight Abatement grant to clean up two
- 10 specific areas within the city. These areas were cleaned
- 11 in the spring and fall of 2004, which then caused the
- 12 disposal to increase that year.
- 13 According to staff's sensitivity analysis, it
- 14 only takes 120 tons to change this jurisdiction's
- 15 diversion rate by 1 percent. So a few couches that they
- 16 picked up really hit them hard.
- 17 Preliminary 2007 disposal data shows a continued
- 18 decrease in disposal. And due to the implementation of
- 19 the residential and commercial recycling programs, city
- 20 staff and our Board staff have realized that the city's
- 21 disposal's decreasing as a result of those programs being
- 22 implemented.
- 23 And I believe we have a representative.
- 24 MR. BROWNLEE: Good morning, Madam Chair, Member
- 25 Brown. I thank you for inviting me here. I don't have

- 1 anything to supplement the report as has been presented by
- 2 your staff. But I did want to thank your staff for
- 3 helping us and coming all the way out to Needles in the
- 4 middle of summer to kind of give us a look see. But thank
- 5 you so much.
- 6 I'm prepared to answer any questions you might
- 7 have.
- 8 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for coming here
- 9 today and being here and working with our staff.
- 10 MR. BROWNLEE: You're quite welcome.
- 11 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you.
- MR. BROWNLEE: Thanks so much.
- 13 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: I'm sorry. Could you identify
- 14 yourself for the court reporter.
- MR. BROWNLEE: David Brownlee, Solid Waste
- 16 Coordinator.
- 17 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you.
- 18 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 19 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Madam Chair, we
- 20 have four jurisdictions left.
- We're going to continue with San Bernardino
- 22 County. In this case, the city of Redlands, Curie Canuela
- 23 and Keir were the staff involved in this.
- 24 The city's implemented all the programs
- 25 identified in its SB 1066 time extension. This includes

- 1 commercial on-site pickup, salvaging of recyclables from
- 2 some of the high-grade roll-off loads, incentivized rates
- 3 for recycling of construction debris, education outreach,
- 4 and biosolids diversion.
- 5 It also has an ordinance mandating that new
- 6 businesses recycle. And it's hired a full-time recycling
- 7 specialist that targets areas that will enable the city to
- 8 further reduce disposal.
- 9 It does, like many cities, have some challenges
- 10 with disposal reporting misallocations, because there's
- 11 some county land areas within its own boundaries. But it
- 12 hasn't been able to adequately document those to get those
- 13 subtracted from the disposal load. Even so, it's got a 48
- 14 percent diversion rate and it's been fully implementing
- 15 its programs.
- I'm not sure if we have a representative.
- 17 Okay. Next is San Bernardino unincorporated.
- 18 Staff on this are Diana Suarez-Arguelles and Melissa
- 19 Vargas.
- The county has also implemented all of its
- 21 programs in its 1066 time extension. These include
- 22 commercial on-site pickup, school recycling programs, C&D
- 23 recycling, educational outreach. It's also adopted a
- 24 buy-recycled procurement policy.
- 25 Also, since 2005 most of the unincorporated areas

- 1 of the county have had mandatory residential collection
- 2 service. The western mountainous areas it's a little more
- 3 difficult to do that. But I think that's a great
- 4 achievement for that kind of geographic spread.
- 5 And then in January 2007, the county rolled out a
- 6 diversion program at its landfills and transfer stations
- 7 to divert C&D materials.
- I'm not sure if we have a representative.
- 9 Yes, we do.
- 10 MR. WULFMAN: Good morning, Chair and member.
- 11 Peter Wulfman, Solid Waste Management Division
- 12 Manager for -- Waste Manager for San Bernardino.
- 13 I'd just like to say a couple things. One is
- 14 that we did start our program. And I think the Chair
- 15 actually went and visited our program at the Victorville
- 16 landfill. And, at that time, we were recycling 25 percent
- 17 of the self-haul loads that were coming in, actually
- 18 netting 25 percent. We rolled out the program to the rest
- 19 of our five -- of five other landfills. And just last
- 20 month, I calculated the last eight months at 40 percent.
- 21 Sounds great, except that we pay our hauler on a
- 22 net tons, so we've got some problems.
- 23 But in addition to that, our disposal has gone
- 24 down in the last year. I just understood it from your
- 25 representative that it was 40,000 tons, which is about ten

- 1 percent. We've been hovering at nine percent for the 2005
- 2 and 2006 years. So hopefully these programs that we've
- 3 implemented will get us over the hump.
- 4 We are actually right now in negotiations with
- 5 all our haulers to implement more commercial recycling.
- 6 So we look like we're really moving forward. And
- 7 hopefully we won't be on this list again.
- 8 Thank you.
- 9 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Keep up the good work. Thank
- 10 you.
- 11 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 12 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Next is the city of
- 13 Lemon Grove in San Diego County. And Keir Furey handled
- 14 this one.
- 15 Lemon Grove also had a time extension -- 1066
- 16 time extension they have implemented as part of this
- 17 commercial, multi-family and C&D diversion programs. The
- 18 city and its franchise hauler, which is EDCO, have made a
- 19 long-term commitment to get more businesses, multi-family
- 20 participants into its recycling programs. And as a
- 21 result, the recycling has increased significantly for
- 22 these programs and disposal has declined over the last
- 23 couple of years.
- In 2005, the city implemented its C&D ordinance.
- 25 And in 2006, EDCO opened up, what I believe at the time

- 1 was, the first permitted C&D facility in the state within
- 2 the city's boundaries. So it's -- I think a number of us
- 3 have been there, and it's quite a facility.
- 4 But the downside of hosting that kind of facility
- 5 is that the city does get some disproportionate
- 6 misallocation of some of the resulting residuals that come
- 7 out of the facility. So the city and EDCO are working to
- 8 resolve that, but they do believe it did impact their 2006
- 9 diversion rates. But they've got a lot of good programs
- 10 going on, and we recommend them for good faith.
- MS. KRABER: Good morning, Madam Chair and
- 12 Committee Member Brown. I'm Barbara Kraber. I'm a
- 13 management analyst in the City Manager's office at Lemon
- 14 Grove.
- 15 Thank you for taking a look at our good-faith
- 16 efforts. We think we're on the right track. We're very
- 17 proud of our C&D facility. I spoke with EDCO two days
- 18 ago, and they have -- since December of '06 when they
- 19 opened that facility, they have processed over 185,000
- 20 tons of C&D debris, 37,000 tons of which belongs to Lemon
- 21 Grove. So we're real glad that's not in the landfill in
- 22 the last two years.
- 23 We've also implemented an E-waste recycling
- 24 event. We started out quarterly in late '07. And now
- 25 we've gone to monthly. I don't know where it's all coming

- 1 from, but we've diverted over 50 tons in the first year of
- 2 that program just out of the city. Most of that's
- 3 residential. We've continued to do outreach to
- 4 businesses. They've not utilized that quite as much, but
- 5 we expect in the second year that to go up as well.
- 6 And, also, EDCO has been working with a
- 7 neighboring city working on the commercial and
- 8 multi-family accounts. And before they started that one
- 9 in the neighboring city, just kind of working through our
- 10 business license list and that sort of thing, they've
- 11 increased our compliance locally. And come January, they
- 12 will be using that model program that they started next
- 13 door in La Mesa.
- 14 And they utilized their admin -- administrative
- 15 citation ordinance to provide the stick part of the
- 16 carrot -- to the carrot part of the program. So we expect
- 17 that that will yield nice results for us as well. And
- 18 it's also allowed them to take a look at getting a little
- 19 more creative again with the older infrastructure
- 20 commercially and multi-family. There's just not room for
- 21 anything else in the enclosure. So they're -- you know,
- 22 they're looking at ways of directing those kinds of
- 23 activities as well.
- 24 So, again, we appreciate staff's assistance and
- 25 your review of our good-faith efforts.

- 1 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you for being here, and
- 2 thank you for all your efforts.
- 3 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 4 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: And next is the
- 5 city of Vista in the County of San Diego. And this was
- 6 handled by Rob Baumann and Keir Furey.
- 7 Vista also had a 1066 time extension. It's fully
- 8 implemented all the elements of that. And these include
- 9 commercial recycling service, expansion, a mixed C&D
- 10 recycling program, green waste diversion, and an
- 11 educational outreach.
- 12 In 2006, the city adopted a C&D ordinance. And
- 13 it's also focused in the last couple years on adding more
- 14 commercial recycling accounts to improve that sector's
- 15 recovery rate.
- As a result, the city's diversion rate increased
- 17 6 percent in 2006. And it continues to show a decline in
- 18 disposal. Preliminary numbers show a decrease in disposal
- 19 of over 24,000 tons between 2005, 2007.
- We do have a representative.
- 21 MR. GARCIA: Good morning, Madam Chair and
- 22 Committee members. Mauro Garcia. I'm the Public Services
- 23 Director with the city of Vista. And just wanted to show
- 24 our appreciation for staff for working with us. Mr.
- 25 Baumann has been excellent. And thank you for

- 1 consideration of a good-faith effort for the city of
- 2 Vista.
- 3 I am here to answer any questions, as well as a
- 4 representative from EDCO. Otherwise, thank you very much.
- 5 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Well, thank you for being here
- 6 and thank you for all of your program implementation.
- 7 Just keep up the good work.
- 8 Thank you.
- 9 LOCAL JURISDICTION, STATE AGENCY & BUSINESS
- 10 ASSISTANCE PROGRAM DIRECTOR LEVENSON: Thank you, Madam
- 11 Chair.
- 12 Before I conclude, I do want to say that I think
- 13 today's comments from the jurisdictions, although we
- 14 didn't have a lot of issues to resolve, I think that
- 15 reflects the work that's gone on over the last several
- 16 months between staff and the jurisdictions. And I want to
- 17 thank the jurisdictions for all their help in getting us
- 18 to this point. And I want to thank our staff for all
- 19 their efforts that they've made to get out into the field.
- 20 And I think this embodies the new direction that the Board
- 21 has asked us to move in. And I thank you for your
- 22 leadership on that.
- So with that, I'd like to conclude, unless you
- 24 have any specific questions, with recommending Option 1,
- 25 and that you adopt Resolution 2008-185, which would be to

- 1 confer good-faith-effort determinations upon the 55
- 2 jurisdictions that are listed in the title. And I'm not
- 3 going to read the title.
- 4 (Laughter.)
- 5 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Thank you, Howard.
- 6 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Do I have to read the
- 7 title?
- 8 I'm kidding.
- 9 I do want to say, before I move the resolution,
- 10 thank you to staff, the Tribunal. I know Rosalie thanked
- 11 you at the beginning. I think the process that you put
- 12 forward in this review has been excellent. It's not only
- 13 shown the success of 939, but it's also shown -- and given
- 14 jurisdictions an opportunity to show what they're doing.
- 15 And it's really -- and we've talked about this a lot.
- 16 It's the partnerships that are necessary between the state
- 17 and local governments to implement these programs and the
- 18 success that we've seen in 939. I mean California, as we
- 19 all know, is the nation's recycling leader. But who would
- 20 have thought back in 1989 when a plan -- we'd still be
- 21 doing the same programs, but with a different focus on
- 22 global warming and climate reduction targets. And the
- 23 benefits that recycling can make to those goals as well is
- 24 incredible. And I think we're going -- we're just on the
- 25 tip of beginning to see how cities and counties can make

- 1 such an incredible impact in their reductions through
- 2 their efforts and program implementation and especially
- 3 recycling.
- 4 So I want to -- also, it was interesting, a lot
- 5 of the themes throughout is disposal reduction. And as
- 6 you know, we worked with the Legislature to really focus
- 7 on disposal reduction, you're doing it. So it's important
- 8 to go back and for us to hear what you're doing, and for
- 9 you to go back and talk to your decision leaders in your
- 10 communities about the impacts that recycling can make in
- 11 global warming as well as, you know, our efforts in the
- 12 state.
- So, anyway, thank you all for being here, those
- 14 who are still here. And a great job to staff.
- With that, I can move Resolution 2008-185.
- 16 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Second.
- 17 That was moved by Member Brown, seconded by
- 18 myself.
- 19 Would you please call the roll.
- 20 COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Brown?
- 21 COMMITTEE MEMBER BROWN: Aye.
- 22 COMMITTEE SECRETARY HIGHTREE: Mulé?
- 23 CHAIRPERSON MULÉ: Aye.
- Thank you.
- 25 And we will put that item on our consent agenda.

90 1 And, again, I just want to thank staff for all of 2 your hard work. I want to thank the jurisdictions and all 3 your partners for all the work that you've done to get us 4 to where we are today with this important mandate from the 5 state. 6 Thank you. If there are no further comments, this meeting is adjourned. 8 9 Thank you. 10 (Thereupon the California Integrated Waste Management Board, Permitting and Compliance 11 Committee meeting adjourned at 12:03 p.m.) 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25

Please note: These transcripts are not individually reviewed and approved for accuracy.

91

1	CERTIFICATE OF REPORTER
2	I, JAMES F. PETERS, a Certified Shorthand
3	Reporter of the State of California, and Registered
4	Professional Reporter, do hereby certify:
5	That I am a disinterested person herein; that the
6	foregoing California Integrated Waste Management Board,
7	Permitting and Compliance Committee meeting was reported
8	in shorthand by me, James F. Peters, a Certified Shorthand
9	Reporter of the State of California, and thereafter
10	transcribed into typewriting.
11	I further certify that I am not of counsel or
12	attorney for any of the parties to said meeting nor in any
13	way interested in the outcome of said meeting.
14	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand
15	this 22nd day of December, 2008.
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	JAMES F. PETERS, CSR, RPR
24	Certified Shorthand Reporter
25	License No. 10063

PETERS SHORTHAND REPORTING CORPORATION (916) 362-2345

→